

ARABICA - ISLAM

MANUSCRIPTA ORIENTALIA. — International Journal for Oriental Manuscript Research. Vol. I, No. 1, July 1995 / Russian Academy of Sciences — The Institute of Oriental Studies — St. Petersburg Branch. Dekadi Publishing Ltd. Oy, Helsinki, 1995. (30 cm, 17 photogr., 73 p.). ISSN 1238-5018. 220 p. in 3 iss. \$ 132.00.

Manuscripta Orientalia est un nouveau journal qui se voue à la présentation, la discussion et la publication de manuscrits provenant de l'ensemble du monde oriental. Dans numéro 1 du premier volume, qui fait l'objet de notre présente critique, le lecteur y trouvera des contributions sur des manuscrits de langues arabe, ottomane, sanskrite, tibétaine et chinoise. Le but des éditeurs, regroupés autour de l'Institut d'Etudes Orientales, section de S. Peterbourg, est d'offrir aussi bien aux spécialistes qu'au public profane un accès à la richesse des manuscrits orientaux. Pour ce faire, les éditeurs ont retenu l'anglais comme langue unique de publication, décision qui d'un côté suscite la tendance de globalisation de la politique culturelle, mais qui d'autre côté risque d'être à l'origine de curieuses idiosyncrasies, telles le mot «*evristics*» (p. 5), russification probable du mot russe pour heuristique. Un grand nombre de manuscrits traités dans *Manuscripta Orientalia* se trouve dans le fonds de l'Institut d'Etudes Orientales.

Parmi les articles à recommander aussi pour les non-spécialistes il faut nommer celui de E. Kychanov. L'auteur y relate la découverte du manuscrit du *Wen-hai bao-yun*, dictionnaire chinois sur la langue xixia (tangoute). Ce manuscrit a été trouvé en 1908 parmi les ruines de Kara-Khoto dans le désert de Gebi par l'aventurier amateur russe P.K. Kozlov. Parvenu à l'Institut d'Etudes Orientales de Léninegrad, il y fut oublié

après le siège de la cité dans la seconde guerre mondiale. Cet article montre combien philologie et histoire se déterminent mutuellement: les intrigues des savants russes et les événements politiques de la Russie en première moitié du 20^{ème} siècle reflète celui des Xi-xia mêmes. Cet article pêche par un manque de clarté dans quelques passages, et l'auteur de la critique s'y est senti désorienté par la succession quelquefois compliquée des arguments. Par exemple, page 42 Kychanov renvoie à un passage cité en mentionnant le titre «*Wen-hai*». Mais de quel «*Wen-hai*» s'agit-il? Dans le texte précédé de la même page se rencontrent deux œuvres portant le titre «*Wen-hai*»: le «*Wen-hai bao-yun*» et un autre dictionnaire, le «*Wen-hai za-lei*». — Après la contribution de E. Kychanov la contribution la plus intéressante pour non-spécialiste est peut-être celle de M.I. Vorobyova-Desyatovskaya concernant un manuscrit unique du *Kāśyapaparivarta-Sūtra*. Elle contient des informations sur l'histoire textuelle et les sur les traductions de ce texte, mais aussi sur son rôle dans l'ensemble des écritures bouddhiques. L'article de O. Akimushkin sur le manuscrit du «*Traité des calligraphes et peintres*» par QĀZĪ AḤMAD QUMĪ donne quelques dates générales sur la situation de la Perse au XVI^{ème} siècle, sur la littérature et sur la signification des calligraphes, mais il expose surtout les détails de l'histoire du manuscrit et de ses sources. La deuxième contribution de M.I. Vorobyova-Desyatovskaya pour ce volume présente les manuscrits tibétains allant du 8^{ème} au 11^{ème} siècles, qui se trouvent dans l'Institut d'Etudes Orientales à S. Peterbourg. Cet article est suivi de la publication d'un de ces manuscrits par Tsuguhito Takeuchi, avec une traduction exacte.

Du point de vue de la méthodologie, une des contributions les plus intéressantes du volume est «*The Asiatic Museum Project: 1. Data-Base on Muslim Seals*» par V. Polosin et E. Rezvan. Les auteurs y montrent l'intérêt que représente l'existence de cachets sur les manuscrits orientaux, qui, disent-ils, peuvent nous informer sur divers aspects de l'histoire des textes, et aussi sur d'autres aspects historiques, philologiques etc. Ils recommandent aussi leur système pour la mémorisation des données gagnées par l'analyse des sceaux. Dans sa contribution, I.E. Petrosyan plaide pour l'attribution des trois manuscrits considérés jusqu'à maintenant anonymes, à d'auteurs connus du XVI^{ème} siècle, dont le plus connu est QOČI BEG. L'argumentation semble plausible, même si — probablement à cause de la brièveté de l'article — elle n'est pas menée jusque ses détails. Mais comme pour les autres contributions dans le premier numéro de *Manuscripta Orientalia*, cette brièveté est fort en accord avec un des principes généraux de ce journal, à savoir, de rendre accessible sous une forme rapidement assimilable des manuscrits peu connus. Enfin, le premier numéro de *Manuscripta Orientalia* est richement illustré (3 photographies colorés sur la jaquette extérieure, 17 pages de photographies noires et blanches à l'intérieur), imprimé sur du papier de très bonne qualité, ce qui rend la lecture des manuscrits publiés très agréable. Souhaitons que le fondement des *Manuscripta Orientalia* sera suivi par une longue série de numéros et volumes spéciaux qui vont faire mieux connaître les manuscrits de l'orient dans tout le monde.

Istanbul, Juillet 1997

Michael HESS

* *
*

LECKER, Michael — Muslims, Jews and Pegans: Studies on Early Islamic Medina. (Islamic History and Civilization, 13). E.J. Brill Publishers, N.V., Leiden, 1995. (25 cm, XVI, [2], 180). ISBN 90-4-10247-7. ISSN 0929-02403. HFL. 95,-; \$ 54.50.

History is a field of study that depends mainly on literary evidence such as reports, testimonies and memories alongside geographical data. Apart from the geographical data, which present hard evidence, other literary data present less trustworthy information. The reason is that in the process of recording events human memory reflects not only its own weakness but also its bias and prejudice. Early Islamic history, especially the Prophet's life in Medina after *hijrā*, depends basically on the *sirā* literature which "is unsatisfactory as the sole source of information on the Prophet and his time." (p. xi)

This book is about the geographical and genealogical history of *Yathrik*/or Madina, about the polo-religious relationship between the three groups mentioned in the title. The author defines the book as a monograph on the geographical history of Medina and its inhabitants aiming at providing the reader with a "firmer ground" to "approach the narrative of the *sirā*." (p. xiv) In order to attain such an objective the author has to investigate other important non-*sirā* sources such as Samhūdī (d. 911/1506) who quotes extensively from earlier historians who wrote about Medina. Beside non-*sirā* historical sources the author investigates geographical and genealogical evidence such as records of fortresses, clan quarters, markets, orchards, fields and irrigation systems. "Naturally", the author continues, "such research demands a jigsaw-puzzle approach to the sources; in other words, collecting small pieces of information and organizing them so as to form a picture." (p. xiv) Besides the reconstruction and interpretation of texts, this monograph includes aspects of historical geography, prosopography and several observations concerning the literary properties of the historical tradition. The results take us some way towards a better understanding of Medina and its society on the eve of the Hijra and during the early Islamic period. At the heart of the monograph's four chapters is the constant of the elevated area south of Medina, which in the early Islamic period was called al-*Āwālī*. Focusing on the area rather than on events and reading the text in conjunction with the map of Medina helps clarify a number of obscure points. The major events in the life of the Prophet, such as the Hijra and the main battles, always remain in the background. Yet, it should be emphasized that this by no means a history; rather, it is an introductory study investigating in depth certain aspects of the Prophet's Medinan period and the Islamic literature dealing with it. (pp. x-xi)

Divided into four chapters THE FIRST CHAPTER — the *Āliya*: orchards and fortresses — deals with geographical aspects of the area. The conclusion indicates the existence of "four constructions of special type" in the *Āliya* not found elsewhere in Medina: four fortresses built strictly for military purposes. The clans owning them were prepared to withstand a prolonged siege. Two of the fortresses belonged to the main Jewish tribes and the other two to Arab clans of the Aws Allāh group. All four fortresses were in the eastern part of the *Āliya*, presumably within a short distance of each other. No similar fortification was to be found in the western part of the *Āliya*, namely Qubā' and al-*Āṣaba*. This made the eastern *Āliya* the most fortified area in Medina then, which

is a conclusion of major importance to understanding Medinan politics at the time of the Prophet. (18)

Chapter two — The Aws Allāh clans — shifts to the clans of the Aws Allāh group which lived in the eastern part of the *Āliya* near the Naḍīr and Qurayza. It concentrates on their role at the time of the Prophet, and particularly on their relatively late conversion to Islam that supports the reliability of the *sirā* literature information on this sensitive issue. (19) Concerning the conversion of Medinan people to Islam the chapter indicates that "many Khazrajīs had already committed themselves to the cause of Islam before Hijra. There were Muslims among the Aws from the Nabīṭ and the *Āmr* b. *Āwf*. Not all the Aws Allāh converted to Islam after the battle of the Ditch. There were two tribal groups of the Aws Allāh [the Salm and the Sa'īd b. Murra] that had converted at an earlier date. But these groups do not weaken the reliability of the statements on the delayed conversion of the other Aws Allāh groups. On the contrary, both groups no longer lived in the territory of the Aws Allāh, and it is this fact which explains their different attitude to the prophet. (p. 28) The case of the Sa'īd shows that an acquaintance with the geography of Medina and the genealogy of its clan can take us beyond the *sirā* account. (p. 35) The verses exchanged between *Āṣmā*' bint Marwān and Ḥassān b. Thābit, for example, confirm Aws Allāh hostile attitude to the Prophet shortly after the Hijra and the split in Medinan society caused by the advent of the Prophet. A split in Medinan society was of course a novelty. But unlike the old one between the Aws and Khazraj, the division this time was not along tribal lines since on the Prophet's side we find not only the Khazraj, but also two out of the five Aws branches, namely the Nabīṭ and the *Āmr* B. *Āwf*. (p. 41) Here again the territorial and genealogical evidence alongside poetic evidence enable the author to reach some conclusions beyond the limitation of the *sirā* literature.

The literature on the Prophet's life focuses only on clans and individuals who supported him, and on his enemies however great or small. Between these groups was a third category which we should be aware of, although it is seldom mentioned: the many non-participants, those who waited on the sideline to see how things would develop. Perhaps they were a silent majority. They did not stand to gain much if Islam succeeded, and would be little hurt in case of failure. The uneven coverage of Medina in the *sirā* means that no judgement concerning the relative size and strength of its clan can be based on the *sirā* report. (35-36) The chapter concludes by emphasizing that "The historical conclusions arrived at in this chapter inspire guarded confidence in the source material. The amount and quality of our data do facilitate sound and serious work on the Prophet's biography. It would be absurd to argue that the fine, detailed information we have on certain aspects of early Islamic Medina is unusable or entirely the outcome of later inventions. Students of Islam are often perplexed by contradictory evidence and there is clearly a large amount of forged material. Certainly many questions will never be answered. Yet, in time a solid foundation of facts may be established whilst we simultaneously improve our analytical tools for this difficult, but by no means inaccessible literature. (49)

The third chapter — Qubā': Muslims, Jews and Pagans — moves to the western side of the *Āliya*, Qubā' and the

much smaller al-ʿAsaba, in order to provide more accurate information about the inhabitants of this area. This information is so vital to clarify the obscure *Dirār* Mosque incident to be dealt with in the fourth chapter. It has already been indicated, in the second chapter, that *Nifāq* was widespread in Qubāʾ in the western ʿĀliya, which was the only part of the ʿĀliya not controlled by the Aws Allāh or the Jewish Naḍīr and Qurayza. (p. 37) The ʿAmr b. ʿAwf of the Aws were referred to as “the people of Qubāʾ”, but this only signifies that they were the dominant group there. Besides the ʿAmr b. ʿAwf there were in Qubāʾ the Balī, clans from the Salm of the Aws Allāh and the Khazrajīs. The author in this chapter occupies himself with providing the reader with detailed information about ‘the converts to Judaism among the ʿAmr b. ʿAwf’, ‘the Jahjabā move from Qubāʾ to al-ʿAsaba’ etc. This information is so important because the focus of the study is mainly the history of the territory and its inhabitants.

The fourth chapter — the *Dirār* Mosque — is the longest one; it occupies more than 70 pages that amount nearly to half the size of the whole book. It starts by investigating ‘the diversity of the accounts’ concerning the incident in *tafsīr* literature. Accounts of *sabab nuzūl* the Qurʾānic verse (9/107) which includes reference to *dirār*, by Ibn ʿAbbas (d. 68/687-88), Ibn ʿUmar (d. 73/692/93), ʿUrwa b. al-Zubayr (d. between 97/711 and 101/720), Saʿīd b. Jubayr (d. 95/714) and Muqātil b. Sulaymān (d. 150/767) are thoroughly analyzed. “*Tafsīr* books in general, and Muqātil’s *tafsīr* in particular”, the author explains, “are indeed indispensable. Because the sources are not made of a repetitive mass of unchanging components, the study of the Prophet’s history cannot be solely based on Ibn Hishām, Ibn Saʿd and Ṭabarī.” (pp. 91-92) These *tafsīr* sources lead to the conclusion that “the possibility that the Mosque was put up by a group not living in Qubāʾ should be ruled out: everything (...) suggests that the *Dirār* incident was a local matter, involving the inhabitants of Qubāʾ. It concerned a specific area of Qubāʾ where both rival mosques, the Mosque of Qubāʾ and the Mosque of *Dirār*, were located.” (p. 125)

Moving from analyzing the incident accounts to investigate the builders of the *Dirār* Mosque, individuals and clans, the author concludes that “In view of the list of participants, there can be no doubt that the *Dirār* Mosque was in the territory of Zayd b. Mālik.” (p. 129) More geographical evidence is investigated to clarify the details of the incident. In his concluding remarks the author repeats that “the much quoted sources for the history of the Prophet, such as Ibn Hishām, Waqidī, Ibn Saʿd and Ṭabarī, offer only a limited amount of evidence both on topography (...) and on the inhabitants, those tribal groups living in the ʿĀliya.” (p. 147) Isn’t it too much to expect such data from such sources? Isn’t it normal that the *sīra* literature concentrates basically on the Prophet, the hero, and on those who are closely connected to him? That is the case of Ibn Hishām and Waqidī. Ibn Saʿd is mainly devoted to genealogy while Ṭabarī focuses on the history of prophets and kings, “al-Rusul wa al-Mulūk.” It was methodological necessity then for the author “to turn to the famous history of Medina written by Samhūdī and to a variety of other sources, mainly geographical and genealogical, in order to discover the available evidence.” (ibid)

The three appendixes of the book clearly demonstrate the different degrees of reliability attached to different historical sources, namely literary accounts, geographical evidence and

genealogical evidence. Literary historical sources concerning Medinan history are mainly apologetic “and are of course unreliable as a source of historical information.” (p. 150) “Geographical evidence has a clear advantage over historical information in that it is not so susceptible to dispute. (...) To a somewhat lesser extent, this also true of the genealogical evidence.” (p. 147) The important basic conclusion demonstrated by this book is that the study of the history of the early Muslim era, especially that of the Prophet’s life, should not be limited to conventional sources of history. *Tafsīr* books, poetry and even collections of *ḥadīth* are as important as geographical and genealogical sources.

Leiden, August 1997

Nasr ABU-ZAID

* *
*

ESS, Josef van — *Theologie und Gesellschaft im 2. und 3. Jahrhundert Hidschra. Eine Geschichte des religiösen Denkens im frühen Islam, Band VI: Texte XXII-XXXV.* Walter de Gruyter & Co., Berlin, 1995. (24 cm, VIII, 490). ISBN 3-11-014267-8.

This is the latter of the two volumes of translated texts which together form the fifth and sixth volumes of van Ess’s monumental study of early Islamic theology. The fifth volume has already been reviewed in this journal (see vol. 53 (1996), cols. 249-53); the present volume continues in the same style and format, providing translations of key texts for the views of the thinkers covered in the second half of third volume and the first part of the fourth.

As in the fifth volume, the texts (here numbering some 860) are divided into chapters (here numbering 14), and typically each chapter is concerned with the views of one man. (The female theologian who reputedly confounded Abū Ḥanīfa for a week (vol. 1, p. 192) seems to have had no successors.) The series begins with Nazzām and ends with Ibn al-Rāwandī. Nazzām is very strongly represented: the 221 pages devoted to him and his pupils, taken with the corresponding 150-page treatment in the third volume, are equivalent to a major monographic presentation of his thought. By this standard Ibn al-Rāwandī, at 58 pages, comes in a poor second; Qāsim b. Khalīl al-Dimashqī rates only two pages. The lists of writings, already provided for some authors in the fifth volume, are naturally a standard feature of the current volume, and tend to be longer. There are also some elegant diagrams to illustrate Nazzām’s physics.

Just as much as the fifth volume, this volume is evidence of van Ess’s seriousness of purpose. Admittedly the texts translated here are less archaic than some of those in the fifth volume, but just because they are later they also tend to be more ferociously technical. In his small-print commentaries to his translations, van Ess not infrequently has reason to remark on the obscurity of the texts he is rendering; he has not taken the easy course of avoiding problematic texts, as he might reasonably have done had he merely been compiling an anthology.

In reviewing the fifth volume I worked through a significant sample of texts, checking the translations against the original Arabic. I have not attempted to repeat this exercise here, if only because the technical language of most of the texts in the present volume places them beyond any

expertise I could claim. I did, however, check a dozen texts here and there, in the course of which I noted the following: XXII 254: This text, which van Ess edited thirty years ago, is a devastating attack by Nazzām on the authority of Prophetic traditions. I checked only the first section, where I would query one implicit vocalisation. In clause *d*, van Ess must be reading *wa-qaḍ narā 'l-faqīh yakdhib fī 'l-aḥādīth wa-yudallis fī 'l-isnād* (“... den Isnād fälscht”); but in the context, the vocalisation *asnād* surely fits better.

XXII 263: Clause *h* begins: *wa-law kāna 'jtimā' al-nās 'alayhi khaṭa'an*.... Van Ess translates: “Wäre das, vorin die Leute übereinstimmen, ein Fehler...”, as if the Arabic were: *wa-law kāna mā 'jtama'a 'alayhi 'l-nās khaṭa'an*.... In the context, *'alayhi* must surely refer back to Abū Bakr; in the phrase *ijtimā' al-nās 'alayhi* a couple of lines above, the reference to him is unambiguous.

XXV 107: This passage forms part of Ash'arī's presentation of the opinions of various individuals and groups on the question whether one may be in a state of political manifestation (*zuḥūr*), implementing the set punishments and enforcing the law, without having an *imām*. The first view given by Ash'arī, and the only one translated here, is that of 'Abbād b. Sulaymān. His position is that there cannot be a legitimate *imām* after 'Alī, and that [thereafter] the Muslims are to rebel if they can (*idhā amkanahum al-khurūj kharajū*), implementing the law, cutting off the hands of thieves, carrying out retaliation, and doing what it had formerly been incumbent on the *imāms* to do [in the days of 'Alī and his predecessors] (*fa-anfadhū 'l-aḥkām wa-qaṭa'ū 'l-surrāq wa-aqādū wa-fa'alū mā kāna yalzamu 'l-a'imma fī'luhu*). Van Ess, however, uses a past tense here: “Wenn die Muslime sich... erheben konnten, so taten sie es”, and similarly to the end of the passage. This is, of course, linguistically possible, but the rubric leads us to expect a statement of a norm, not of a fact about the past, and the three further opinions which Ash'arī adduces after 'Abbād's conform to this expectation.

With the publication of this sixth volume, only the fourth is yet to come. This volume will complete the chronological survey, taking the story from the Mu'tazilites at the time of the Miḥna to the enigmatic figure of Ibn al-Rāwandī. It will also offer a thematic recapitulation (“Problemgeschichtliche Zusammenfassung”) of the content of the entire work.

Princeton, June 1997

Michael COOK

* *
*

UMMAYYAD HISTORY in the Ṭabarī Translation Series.

A Review of

MORONY, Michael G. — The History of al-Ṭabarī, Vol. XVIII: Between Civil Wars: The Caliphate of Mu'awiyah. State University of New York Press, Albany, 1987. (23 cm, XIII, 261). ISBN 0-87395-933-7. ISBN 0-88706-314-4;

HOWARD, I.K.A. — The History of al-Ṭabarī, Vol. XIX: The Caliphate of Yazid b. Mu'awiyah. State University of New York Press, Albany, 1990. (23 cm, XVI, 248). ISBN 0-7914-0040-9. ISBN 0-7914-0041-7;

HAWTING, G.R. — The History of al-Ṭabarī, Vol. XX: The Collapse of Sufyanid Authority and the Coming of the Marwanids. State University of New York Press,

Albany, 1989. (23 cm, XVIII, 246). ISBN 0-88706-855-3. ISBN 0-88706-857-X;

FISHBEIN, Michael — The History of al-Ṭabarī, Vol. XXI: The Victory of the Marwanids. State University of New York Press, Albany, 1990. (23 cm, XVIII, 260). ISBN 0-7914-0221-5. ISBN 0-7914-0222-3;

ROWSON, Everett K. — The History of al-Ṭabarī, Vol. XXII: The Marwanid Restoration. State University of New York Press, Albany, 1989. (23 cm, XIV, 228). ISBN 0-88706-975-4. ISBN 0-88706-976-2;

HINDS, Martin — The History of al-Ṭabarī, Vol. XXIII: The Zenith of the Marwanid House. State University of New York Press, Albany, 1990. (23 cm, XVI, 254). ISBN 0-88706-721-2. ISBN 0-88706-722-0;

POWERS, David Stephan — The History of al-Ṭabarī, Vol. XXIV: The Empire in Transition. State University of New York Press, Albany, 1989. (23 cm, XVII, 218). ISBN 0-7914-0072-7. ISBN 0-7914-0073-5;

BLANKENSHIP, Khalid Yahya — The History of al-Ṭabarī, Vol. XXV: The End of Expansion. State University of New York Press, Albany, 1989. (23 cm, XIX, 219). ISBN 0-88706-569-4. ISBN 0-88706-570-8.

With a ninth volume translated by Hillenbrand, which has already been reviewed in this journal,¹⁾ these eight volumes from the Ṭabarī translation series cover the entire Umayyad period of Islamic history. Islamic history as we know it for the early and classical periods goes back, in one way or another, to the third AH/ninth AD chronicler al-Ṭabarī. Consequently, for the Umayyad age these volumes constitute the “standard history” on which many historians — ancient and modern — have relied. Much of what is summarized below is therefore very familiar to scholars who devote their attention to this period.

The volume (number XVIII) translated by Morony deals with the reign of the first “official” Umayyad caliph, Mu'awiyah, which lasted some two decades (from 41-60 AH/661-680 AD). “Official” because the earlier, third so-called orthodox caliph 'Uthmān was also an Umayyad. This minor point illustrates just one weakness of a periodization based on dynasties. The lack of a better, more widely accepted one forces us, however, to work within this unsatisfactory framework.

Throughout the text of this volume one reads about the continuous wheeling and dealing of the clever, diplomatic, manipulative and especially shrewd politician Mu'awiyah. Attention is paid to the central role of Ziyād b. Abīhi, the adopted brother of Mu'awiyah and his right hand in asserting caliphal authority. The relationship between Mu'awiyah and the founder of the wing of the Umayyad family (Marwān b. al-Ḥakam) which later supplanted this Sufyanid one — the Marwānid wing — is discussed and betrays al-Ṭabarī's awareness of the course of events in later Umayyad history. Marwān b. al-Ḥakam's dismissal and replacement by a closer relative of Mu'awiyah presages the struggle between the Sufyanid and Marwānid wings of the family although later in Mu'awiyah's reign Marwān was reinstated. The importance of the caliph Mu'awiyah is that he introduced primogeniture as a principle for the heir to caliphal rule — a rule that most of the caliphs who followed, Umayyad or otherwise, adhered to.

¹⁾ John A. Nawas, Review of C. Hillenbrand, The waning of the Umayyad caliphate. Volume XXVI of the history of al-Ṭabarī. *Bibliotheca Orientalis*, 49:1992, 863-865.

Surprising — certainly in comparison with the other volumes under review here — is the observation that the translator's preface to this volume counts no more than thirty lines. Succinctly, Morony sketches for his readers the highlights of the volume on Mu'āwīya's reign adding a few words about al-Ṭabarī's main sources for this period.

Volume XIX, translated by Howard, deals with the short reign of Mu'āwīya's son, Yazīd I (60-64/680-683). The preface to this volume is extensive. It provides a good overview of the main events during the caliph's reign which lasted some four years. The volume is replete with details on the two major "anti-caliphates" to Yazīd's rule, namely that of al-Ḥusayn b. 'Alī and his "Shiite" following and that of the Meccan "aristocrat" leader Ibn al-Zubayr. The section on al-Ḥusayn is, however, much more exhaustive than the section on Ibn al-Zubayr because the battle of Karbalā', during which al-Ḥusayn and a group of his supporters found their death, is described at length by al-Ṭabarī.

Hawting is the translator of the next volume (XX). The translator offers his readers a fitting and well-organized preface. Alongside a general overview of the historical context of the very short reigns of Mu'āwīya II and Marwān b. al-Ḥakam (mentioned above) and the material al-Ṭabarī uses, Hawting additionally includes a useful section on tribal divisions since he considers these divisions important for understanding many events described in this volume. The Marwānids replaced the Sufyānids and Marwān b. al-Ḥakam's quest for securing allegiance is found in these pages. Again, opposition to Umayyad rule — Sufyānid or Marwānid — demands much of the attention of the reader of this section in al-Ṭabarī's History. Central is the movement of the *Tawwābūn*, those Kufans who thought it a duty to take revenge for the martyrdom of al-Ḥusayn at Karbalā' — as repentance for the shame and disgrace they experienced for not assisting the son of 'Alī at a time when he tried to regain the caliphate for those whom they considered its rightful owner, the 'Alid family. This ultimately led to the revolt of al-Mukhtār in which the reader of al-Ṭabarī's account is struck by the seemingly inordinate participation in the revolt of *mawālī* (converts to Islam who, as clients, affiliated themselves to an Arab patron). Besides the description of the *Tawwābūn* movement and al-Mukhtār's revolt, one reads about the anti-caliph Ibn al-Zubayr. This man's primary concern was not the government troops of the Umayyads but the Kharijite rebels whom he fought and who at once also made life difficult for the Umayyad caliph.

The structure of Fishbein's preface (in volume XXI) is typical for the Ṭabarī series: an overview of main events is given, with a listing of sources al-Ṭabarī relied on for the particular section and a description of the manuscripts used for the De Goeje edition of the Arabic text. This volume narrates how the Umayyad caliph 'Abd al-Malik (r. 65-86/685-705) became the uncontested ruler of the Islamic empire. The end of al-Mukhtār and his rebellion is narrated as well as the defeat in Mecca of Ibn al-Zubayr at the hands of the very able and ruthless governor al-Ḥajjāj.

Rowson's section (volume XXII) includes the famous speech delivered by al-Ḥajjāj in which he warns the people of Iraq not to dare rebel against him and the Umayyad caliph. The speech is indicative of the further consolidation of the power of 'Abd al-Malik. The empire was centralized and one significant feature of this policy of centralization was the coinage reform introduced by 'Abd al-Malik. The Kharijite

movement which had also fought against the now dead anti-caliph Ibn al-Zubayr was completely put to rest by al-Ḥajjāj.

The *Zenith of the Marwānid House* is indeed a very apt title for the next volume (XXIII) which Hinds translated. Both Rowson (in the volume just mentioned) and Hinds provide excellent overviews on the sections which they translated. In the Hinds-volume, the remainder of the reign of 'Abd al-Malik is dealt with. An account follows on the short reign of al-Walīd I who ruled half as many years as did Mu'āwīya and the other great Umayyad caliph 'Abd al-Malik — namely ten years (from 86-96/705-715). Al-Ḥajjāj is again a main actor on the stage built by al-Ṭabarī. Additionally, the important rebellion of Ibn al-Ash'ath — which created difficulties for Marwānid supremacy — is described in this volume.

Powers' section (volume XXIV) provides details on the reigns of three Umayyad caliphs, Sulaymān (r. 96-99/715-717), 'Umar II (r. 99-101/717-720) — the Umayyad caliph noted for his piety and respected for it by many parties — and Yazīd II (r. 101-105/720-724). Once again, the central authorities are confronted with discord in the empire. This social unrest had been attributed to the tribal conflict between Yamānī's and Qaysī's which eventually contributed to the end of Umayyad reign. The preface by Powers' on this tribal animosity provided the opportunity for Crone to write an article on the matter, to which the interested reader on tribal affairs and political affiliations is referred.²⁾

The trend of the dissolution of Umayyad rule and of diminishing centralized Islamic authority is the main theme in the last of the volumes reviewed here and translated by Blankenship (volume XXV). The first part of the caliphate of the last Umayyad ruler who could reign for more than just a few years, Hishām b. 'Abd al-Malik (r. 105-125/724-743), is focal in this section. Here, governors come and go, are appointed and dismissed, one after the other by the caliph and this lack of stability in the empire illustrates the inability of the central authorities to take effective action against their gradual loss of power. Moreover, the military inadequacy of Umayyad forces especially against Byzantine attacks and the beginnings of the Abbasid revolutionary movement which would end Umayyad rule are also narrated in this section of al-Ṭabarī's History. Though the eight volumes were translated by eight different individuals, the manner in which the prefaces and annotations were carried out is remarkably similar. As an example, seven of the eight translators provide on the average almost three and half footnotes for each translated page. A notable exception to this conformity in style is the volume translated by Morony which counts on the average a little more than two and a half footnotes per page. As noted above, Morony's preface is also the shortest of the eight volumes and apparently this translator opted for brevity instead of exhaustiveness. All in all, however, the eight volumes do meet the overall aim of the Ṭabarī translation series: providing a worthy English translation of the most illustrious chronicler of early and classical Islam for both a specialist and nonspecialist reading audience.

Having decided to take the eight volumes of this review as a unity, I noticed that the entire project would have benefited if the publisher had listed the Islamic years dealt with in

²⁾ Patricia Crone, "Were the Qays and Yemen of the Umayyad period political parties?" in *Der Islam*, 71 (1994): 1-57.

each volume on each volume's spine. This remark does not, however, tarnish in any way the accomplishment of the Tabarī series as a whole.

Department of History
University of Utrecht
August 1997

John A. NAWAS

* *
*

HALM, Heinz — *The Empire of the Mahdi: the Rise of the Fatimids* / transl. from the German by Michael Bonner. (Handbuch der Orientalistik, 1/26). E.J. Brill Publishers N.V., Leiden, 1996. (24 cm, XIV, ill., maps, [2] + 22 p. plates). ISBN 90-04-10056-3. ISSN 0169-9423. \$ 167.75.

Good news: Heinz Halm's excellent outline of the early history of the Fāṭimids is now available in English.

The book deals with undoubtedly one of the most exciting and fascinating chapters of Islamic history: the founding and spread of the secret sect of the Ismā'īlīs, its adventurous rise to play a prominent role in the history of the Middle East in the 9th century, the beginnings of the caliphal dynasty in North Africa, and, finally, the establishment and further development of the Fāṭimids until the founding of Cairo, their capital.

The religious outlook and political goals of the Ismā'īliya (which was generally known in the Middle Ages under the name of Fāṭimids, and whose supreme head today is the Agha Khan), had been covered for centuries by conjecture, rumours and evil allegations. As the Ismā'īlīs kept their writings secret, their history had been accessible to historical research until the 19th century only through polemically glossed over Medieval descriptions, which, in part, deliberately distorted historical facts. It was, above all, the Russian Orientalist Vladimir Ivanov, whose activities gave essential impetus to a systematic investigation into this field of Islamic history. He, who had fled from St. Petersburg after the Great October Revolution and who was given shelter by Ismā'īlī friends in British India, finally got access to their libraries and started to edit and translate texts not available until then. Albeit ever since a number of special surveys on the Ismā'īliya and the Fāṭimids have been published — in past, by renowned Ismā'īlī scholars —, an overall survey-study of their early religious and political history had been missing. This gap has been filled by Halm's book.

The impression that this volume, despite its high scholarly claim, almost appears like a "best-seller", may be acknowledged with pleasure by everybody expecting from a book in the non-fictional area, in addition to new insights and an increase of knowledge, also a fair deal of literary entertainment. So, anecdotes taken from the Arabic sources, add, as one might say, spice to this otherwise strictly designed study. The mostly original reports on the daily life of the Ismā'īlīs and the Fāṭimid caliphs or detailed narrative accounts by participants and bystanders, protagonists and victims, create a vivid and cultural-historically interesting picture of the history of the Mahdī state, with its tensions arising from the "realization of a utopia, religion and power, hope and disappointment, loyalty and betrayal" [p. 3].

It is not surprising that the book since its first publication in German (*Das Reich des Mahdi. Der Aufstieg der Fatimi-*

den. C.H. Beck'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung, München 1991) has become an almost indispensable reference work for this period of Islamic history. The author, Professor of Islamic Studies at the University of Tübingen and an intimate expert of Shī'ite Islam, has become prominent through a number of relevant publications (e.g., *Die Schia*, 1988; Engl.: *Shiism*, 1991; *Der schiitische Islam. Von der Religion zur Revolution*, 1994; or recently *The Fatimids and their Traditions of Learning* (Ismaili Heritage Series, 2; London 1997). — The fact that the English edition was done by another expert of Medieval Islamic History, M. BONNER, Ass. Professor at the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor), turns out to be a lucky incident for this publication, resulting in a precise and neat translation.

The contents of the book will only be cursorily discussed here:

After the introduction ("*Fatimids and Isma'ilis*", pp. 1-3, pp. 1-3), chapter 1 ("*The Secret Order*", pp. 5-57) deals with the first activities of the later founder of the sect of the Ismā'īlīs, 'Abdallāh al-akbar. Based on latest research results, it pursues the identity of this somewhat obscure descendant of the Arab Prophet. It deals with the theological background of the Ismā'īlite doctrine of salvation, furthermore with the structure and function of the network of propaganda, with the early missionary activities of the Ismā'īlīs and the emergence of secret cells in Iraq, Yemen, India, Eastern Arabia (Bahrain) and the predominantly Berberic Maghreb, with initiation rules and rites as well as the structure of the secret Ismā'īlī society with its headquarter in Salamiya, a little spot in Syria.

Chapter II ("*The Appearance of the Mahdi*", pp. 58-140) describes the throes, setbacks, persecution and the schism of the Ismā'īliya (→ segregation of the "old-believing" Qarmāṭīs) at the turn of the 9th century, when the leaders of the mission replaced "the phantom 'Muḥammad ibn Ismā'īl' with a human being of flesh and blood" [p. 59], i.e., the nephew of the Grandmaster (*ḥujja*) Abū-Shalaghlagh. As his location became known the Mahdī had to flee from Syria in face of the 'Abbāsīd Caliph's troops. We learn about the circumstances and the background of his escape to Egypt and to North Africa, and also — again through witnesses' reports — how he started to build the Mahdī state.

Chapter III ("*The Caliph al-Mahdī Billāh (909-934)*", pp. 141-274) describes the initially triumphant proclamation of the first Fāṭimid Caliph in Raqqāda and Qayrawān. It deals with the increasing resistance of the Kutāma Berbers, which was triggered off by the lavish life-style of the Mahdī, and his incapability of completing the auspicious miracles, as well as the fact that this resistance was suffocated in blood just like the other efforts of proclaiming an anti-Mahdī. We are told about the ups and downs of the Ismā'īlī societies in the Ismā'īlite "islands" in Iran, Iraq, Eastern Arabia and Yemen as well as the first military activities of the Fāṭimids in Egypt and their subjugation of the Maghreb.

Chapter IV ("*The Collapse of the Empire. Al-Qā'im bi-Amr Allāh (934-946)*", pp. 275-309) portrays the attempts by the Fāṭimids to strengthen their power in the Maghreb and to extend their caliphate up to Spain and Muslim Sicily. It outlines the wretched end of the pro-Fāṭimid society in Yemen, and the almost complete collapse of the empire in the Maghreb under pressure of the Khārijites led by Abū Yazīd. Further subjects include the revolutionization and Hellenization of the secret teachings by the Dā'ī of Bukhara, Muḥammad al-Nakhsabī (al-Nasafī) as well as the influence of Neoplatonic thought on the scientific activities of the Ismā'īliya in the first half of the 10th century.

Chapter V [*“New Beginning. Al-Manṣūr bi-Naṣr Allāh (946-953)”*, pp. 310-337] relates the persecution and the sad end of Abū Yazīd (“the swindler”, *al-Dajjāl*, as this last important representative of the militant Khārijites of the North African Berbers was called by the Fāṭimids) as well as the diplomatic and military differences with Byzantium.

Chapter VI [*“The Imam. Al-Mu‘izz li-Dīn Allāh (953-975)”*, pp. 338-422] provides and insight into the religious doctrine of the Maḥdī state in North Africa, into its scientific, economic and administrative structure and its diplomacy. It ends with the take-over of power in Egypt and the “moving” of the Fāṭimids to the newly founded capital of Cairo.

At the end of the book, one finds an annotated bibliography of the sources [pp. 423-428], which does not merely list the bibliographical references but provides — just like in the German edition — brief information on the life and importance of the Medieval authors, the character of the sources, as well as hints on translations in European languages. A bibliography of the secondary literature [pp. 429-434] and a general index [pp. 434-452] wind up the volume.

Halle (Saale), September 1997

Sebastian GÜNTHER

* *
*

MORRAY, David — An Ayyubid Notable and his World: Ibn al-‘Adīm and Aleppo as portrayed in his Biographical Dictionary of People Associated with the City. (Islamic History and Civilization, Studies and Texts; 5). E.J. Brill, Leiden 1994. XII, 235 pp. ISBN 90-0409956-5.

Il y a un grand nombre de dictionnaires biographiques dans la littérature arabo-islamique classique, qui sont à la disposition des spécialistes, sans lesquels il est souvent impossible de travailler, et de dire parfois au moins quelque chose, concernant des figures diverses de ce passé culturel de l’Islam. Les grandes œuvres dans ce domaine sont dominées par le souci religieux et la présence d’un type de lettré, le spécialiste des sciences du *ḥadīth*; et ceci ne peut étonner, comme on le verra par la suite. Vu l’importance de ces dictionnaires, qui, à côté des dictionnaires de langues, offrent une aide inégalable dans le travail d’édition, de classement des textes, de leurs auteurs, de leurs milieux, on ne peut que se réjouir de voir ce travail, présenté comme doctorat à la Faculty of Oriental Studies de l’Université d’Oxford. Ce fait est encore mis en relief par la spécificité de ce dictionnaire biographique, qui est sur Alep, deuxième ville importante de Syrie, d’autant plus que nous savons que ce pays a déjà donné naissance au livre d’Ibn ‘Asākir, *Tārīkh madīnat Dimashq*, dont on aura à parler plus loin.

L’auteur est Ibn al-‘Adīm (1192/93-1262) et son œuvre majeure porte comme titre *Bughyat al-talab fī tārikh Ḥalab*. M. Morray étudie cet auteur, qui n’est pas mal connu, mais qui est présenté sous un jour nouveau dans une introduction (1-19), avec une mise au point sur la situation de l’homme, de son œuvre, connu comme littérateur, enseignant, historien et homme d’état (surtout missions diplomatiques), ainsi que sur celle de la Syrie du nord à son époque. Il était nécessaire de donner des détails concernant forme et contenu du livre, qui est l’opus magnum de l’auteur, dont l’original a été formé de 40 volumes, dont 10 seulement nous sont arrivés, le premier étant topographique, les 9 autres prosopographiques; de

cette manière on se rend compte de la valeur de cette œuvre remarquable, comme source d’information sur la Syrie du nord, à côté de *Tārīkh madīnat Dimashq* susmentionné.

Le chapitre deux (20-121), le plus long de la thèse, se propose, dans une sélection de 65 notices biographiques, de faire valoir le choix et la présentation de la matière traitée, proche, chronologiquement parlant, de l’auteur; de là l’intérêt pour M. Morray de les présenter sous cette forme élargie, en vue d’illuminer le monde de l’auteur, l’élaboration et la mise par écrit de son livre et Ibn al-‘Adīm lui-même. Tout en respectant cette intention, on aurait souhaité voir les noms avec plus de clarté, avec un intervalle d’une ligne de plus entre eux, ce qui n’aurait alourdi le nombre global des pages du livre que très peu.

Le chapitre trois (122-143) est consacré au monde de la *Bughya*: les notables religieux d’Alep et le pouvoir de l’état, à commencer par le clan de l’auteur lui-même, ainsi que les seigneurs des provinces qui avaient des villages entiers comme bien privé (non comme *Iktā’*), mais à l’avantage desquels ils faisaient peu, alors qu’envers la ville d’Alep ils se montraient pleins d’activité et de bienfaisance, pour acquérir la *ḥurba* d’Allah (comme p.ex. des écoles, des mosquées et d’autres monuments publics qu’ils fondaient, achevaient de construire ou restauraient etc.). A ces catégories de gens décrits, il faut ajouter les maîtres des *madrasas*, qu’on a employées pour contrecarrer l’influence chiite dominante avant les Ayyūbides dans la première partie du VI^e/XII^e siècle dans la ville, et enfin les mystiques qui comptaient, dans les institutions publiques, plusieurs personnalités qui sympathisaient avec leur doctrine religieuse, bien attrayante à la foi et à l’imagination populaire.

Le chapitre quatre (144-150) discute des réflexions officielles du livre, dont la mise en chantier devrait rappeler un intérêt, du côté du pouvoir local, aussi grand que celui témoigné pour la compilation de l’œuvre d’Ibn ‘Asākir à Damas; mais, malheureusement, les pages qui en témoignent *expressis verbis* n’ont pas survécu.

Le chapitre cinq (151-165) est réservé à la compilation elle-même, dont les différentes étapes sont passées en revue: voyages diplomatiques (ou autres) lectures, *samā’*, achat, copiage etc. Alors que le sixième (166-175) traite de la mise par écrit de l’œuvre et le dernier (176-195) de réflexions personnelles, concernant les traits que l’auteur appréciait particulièrement, comme certaines qualités scientifiques répandues dans la culture islamique classique (mémorisation, récitation et exégèse du Coran, sciences de la tradition, *fiqh*, poésie, grammaire, généalogie, histoire ancienne des arabes etc.), et qui faisaient fureur tout au long des siècles avant lui; de même touchant la mise en application de ces vues dans sa propre vie, ainsi que le style employé dans la *Bughya*, qui est celui d’un anthologiste.

Il faut bien sûr attirer l’attention sur l’apport si positif de cette thèse de doctorat qui a abordé un sujet important, difficile à cerner, vu les aspects très multiples qu’une œuvre de cette nature suggère à l’analyse: ce qui a été soulevé comme thèmes, analysés avec discernement et une vue suffisamment globale à l’intérieur de ce genre de production culturelle de l’Islam classique est énorme. Grâce à ce travail on voit quelles sont les enjeux scientifiques liés à l’exploration de telles œuvres à l’intérieur de nos disciplines islamologiques: d’abord des questions topographiques qui auraient pu naturellement être poussées ici un peu plus loin, surtout en fonction du *Tārīkh* d’Ibn ‘Asākir aux dimensions inégalables

et qui apporte dans ce domaine une présentation nettement plus élaborée et intéressante que le *Tārīkh Baghdād* d'al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī; déjà Ibn 'Asākir laissait rattacher, par l'intermédiaire de spécialistes du monde biblique, al-Shām intimement à cette catégorie de pays (de villes) bénis par le créateur, dès le début de sa création, comme on le voit aussi non seulement chez al-Baghdādī, mais aussi dans la chronique de Ṣan'ā' (et ailleurs) tout clairement, là-dessus R.G. Houry, *Zur Bedeutung des A.B. 'Abdallāh ar-Rāzī für die Geschichte des Jemen, Die Welt des Islams, XX, 1-2* (1981) 87-103, etc.

Le côté topographique me paraît d'un intérêt particulier, car, après tout, ce sont les véritables chroniques des villes, les plus précieuses dans ce domaine, que la culture islamique ait produites: les efforts de l'auteur sont assurément voyant de faire valoir en quelques pages la contribution de cette immense chronique à ce sujet; néanmoins, il reste beaucoup de questions très utiles à discuter, en vue de mettre en exergue la valeur des informations historiques, géographiques ainsi que culturelles de l'opus étudié ici, du fait que sur chaque ville islamique, et dès les tout premiers siècles de l'Islam, énormément de matériaux étaient mis en circulation, souvent en guise d'introduction aux thèmes historiques, bio-bibliographiques, comme c'est le cas par exemple d'Ibn 'Abd al-Ḥakam dans ses *Futūḥ Miṣr*, qui forment une des sources essentielles de la topographie, de l'histoire des conquêtes arabes de l'Égypte, des juges, des institutions etc., malgré qu'ils ne soient composés que d'un volume. Ne parlons pas des autres aspects qu'on aurait pu faire valoir un peu plus intensément (culture par exemple...), en restreignant la présentation des 65 notices à quelques-unes de marquantes, d'autant plus qu'il s'agit là d'un genre très répandu, et de là trop connu en Islam, qu'il est d'ailleurs plus correct d'appeler bio-bibliographique, puisque ce dernier aspect est non des moindres dans ce genre de livre et qu'il constitue parfois les seules sources d'information sur des auteurs classiques (les exemples à donner sont très nombreux dans ce domaine, et tous ceux qui travaillent surtout sur les premiers siècles islamiques pourraient être cités ici).

Heidelberg, octobre 1997

R.G. KHOURY

* *
*

ADANG, Camilla — *Muslim Writers on Judaism and the Hebrew Bible: From Ibn Rabban to Ibn Hazm*. (Islamic Philosophy Theology and Science, 22). E.J. Brill Publishers N.V., Leiden, 1996. (25 cm, VIII, 322). ISBN 90-04-10034-2. HFL. 140,-; \$ 90.50.

Das Buch ist für Islamwissenschaftler und Judaisten, für Mediävisten, vergleichende Religions- und für Literaturwissenschaftler, aber auch für Kulturhistoriker und Soziologen von Interesse. Anhand literarischer Äußerungen von neun muslimischen Gelehrten des 9. bis 11. Jahrhunderts untersucht es das Verständnis der Muslime vom Judentum und seiner heiligen Schrift sowie die muslimisch-jüdische Polemik im Mittelalter. Die Autorin — Absolventin der Universität Nijmegen, derzeit *visiting lecturer* an der Tel Aviv University — leistet mit dieser Studie einen wichtigen Beitrag zur Religionsgeschichte.

Das Material wird differenziert und kenntnisreich aus den Quellen erarbeitet, analysiert und zu einem Gesamtbild

verdichtet. Zentrale Themen sind zum einen die Kenntnisse der Muslime vom Judentum und vom biblischen Kanon, wie sie sich in den ausgewählten arabischen Quellen repräsentieren. Zum anderen werden die Versuche bestimmter muslimischer Gelehrter analysiert, die nachzuweisen versuchen, daß a) das Recht, wie es in den heiligen Texten des Judentums enthalten ist, durch den Koran abrogiert wurde, b) sich Hinweise auf das Prophetentum Muḥammads bereits in der Torah finden, und c) die »heilige (Ur-)Schrift« in der Torah im Hinblick auf Textbestand (*tahrīf an-naṣṣ*) bzw. Inhalt (*tahrīf al-ma'ānī*) mißrepräsentiert oder von den Juden sogar verfälscht wurde [s. bes. Kap. 7].

Was die mittelalterlichen Gelehrten als Hauptargumente für die Überlegenheit des Islam anführen, ist grundsätzlicher Natur, aber nicht spektakulär: Zum einen wird auf die Authentizität des Koran verwiesen. Sie manifestiere sich vor allem in seiner Existenz in einer einzigen Textform, wohingegen die Torah in verschiedenen Rezensionen vorliege. Zum anderen sei die Authentizität der göttlichen Dogmen, der religiösen, rechtlichen, ethischen u.a. Prinzipien im Islam garantiert durch die direkte Übernahme der Lehren vom Propheten und deren unverfälschte weitere Tradierung. Explizit wird dabei auf das islamische Lehr- und Überlieferungswesen Bezug genommen. Die unter den Religionen einzigartige Instanz des *Isnāds* — d.h. jene nach muslimischem Verständnis bis zum Propheten zurückreichende Kette vertrauenswürdiger Überlieferer — sichere zudem eine lückenlose Überlieferung der autoritativen Texte, wohingegen die Tradierung im Judentum Lücken aufweise [S. 189].

Die Untersuchung C. Adangs ist breit angelegt und kann in ihren Ergebnissen aus zwei Gründen als repräsentativ gelten: Erstens handelt es sich bei den ausgewählten Autoren um Vertreter ganz unterschiedlicher literarischer Genre der klassischen arabischen Literatur, d.h. der narrativen und chronologischen Historiographie, der Polemik und Apologetik, des *Kalām* und der Koranexegese. Zweitens wird ein weites Spektrum der Geisteshaltungen erfaßt. Diese Vielfalt der intellektuellen Auffassungen ergibt sich aus den jeweils individuellen religiösen und theologischen Überzeugungen der betr. Gelehrten sowie ihrem Wirken in politisch und kulturell verschiedenen Regionen des islamischen Weltreiches.

Folgende Autoren werden behandelt: 1. der in Ṭabaristān und Samarrā' wirkende, ursprünglich christliche 'Alī Ibn Rabban at-Ṭabarī (st. wahrsch. 865), der vor allem durch seine medizinischen Arbeiten bekannt ist; 2. der orthodoxe sunnitische Theologe und Literat Ibn Qutaiba (st. 889) aus Bagdad; 3. der zwölfer-schiitische Historiker, Geograph und Universalgelehrte al-Ya'qūbī (st. ca. 905 in Ägypten); 4. der berühmte Historiker und Koranexeget Muḥammad ibn Ḡarīr at-Ṭabarī (st. 923); 5. der imāmitische Geograph, Historiker, Literat und Vielreisende al-Mas'ūdī (st. 956 in Ägypten); 6. der wahrscheinlich schiitische Enzyklopädist und Historiker al-Maqdisī (st. ca. 966) aus Jerusalem; 7. der aš'aritische Theologe al-Bāqillānī (st. 1013 in Bagdad); 8. der Naturwissenschaftler und »Freigeist« al-Birūnī (st. um 1050-1) aus der Provinz Ḥwārizm; sowie 9. der literarisch und juristisch interessierte, aber auch politisch aktive Ibn Ḥazm (st. 1064) aus Spanien. — Die Vorstellung dieser Autoren und ihrer für die Untersuchung herangezogenen Werke in KAPITEL 2 [S. 23-69] besitzt eigenständigen Wert, da sie neueste Forschungsergebnisse berücksichtigt.

Zunächst aber macht KAPITEL 1, »*The Reception of Biblical Material in Early Islam*« [S. 1-22], mit der Problematik

bekannt. Es schildert kurz die Geschichte von Juden und Christen auf der arabischen Halbinsel in vor- und frühislamischer Zeit und gibt einen allgemeinen Überblick über die »Rezeption« biblischen Materials seit dem Auftreten Muḥammads bis in die Abbasidenzeit. Eingegangen wird auf die ersten arabischen (Teil-) Übersetzungen der Bibel und auch auf die wahrscheinlich älteste vollständige, direkt aus dem Hebräischen ins Arabische erfolgte Bibelübersetzung jüdischer Provenienz durch Sa'adya Gaon (st. 942), einem jüdischen Gelehrten, der schon zur seinen Lebzeiten auch in muslimischen Kreisen große Achtung genoß. Detaillierter behandelt wird die — zum Teil islamischen Bedürfnissen angepaßte — Inkorporation biblischen Materials in verschiedene Genre der arabisch-islamischen Literatur.

Mit diesem Hintergrund untersucht KAPITEL 3, »*Jewish Beliefs and Practices*« [S. 70-109], die Aussagen der Quellen zu Verständnis und Kenntnis der Muslime vom jüdischen Glauben und von den religiösen Praktiken der Juden (Feste, Feiertage, Rechtsvorschriften usw.). Es wird der Frage nachgegangen, was in den arabischen Quellen richtig wiedergegeben, was verballhornt oder unrichtig geschildert wird. Hinterfragt wird aber auch, warum dies in der einen oder in der anderen Weise geschieht. Dabei wird deutlich, daß sich etwa al-Maqdisī und al-Birūnī in sachlicher und kenntnisreicher Weise, Ibn Ḥazm dagegen in eher polemischer Weise mit dem Judentum auseinandersetzen.

Das arabische Quellenmaterial wird teilweise referiert, zum Teil auch in Übersetzung ganzer Passagen geboten. Der Verfasserin gelingt es, ein lebendiges und authentisches Bild von der seinerzeit lebhaft geführten intellektuellen Auseinandersetzung der Muslime mit dem Judentum zu entwerfen. Einmal mehr wird deutlich, daß sich die Muslime nicht nur auf Lektüre und literarische Äußerungen beschränkten, sondern nicht selten direkte Dispute mit ihren jüdischen Gelehrtenkollegen führten. Die Tatsache, daß sich die Muslime vor allem an den anthropomorphistischen Elementen im Judentum rieben, auf welche sie — tatsächlich oder vermeintlich — vor allem in rabbinischen Quellen stießen, spielte dabei eine zentrale Rolle. Ibn Ḥazm beispielsweise war über solche Anthropomorphismen geradezu schockiert und bezeichnete sie als »schlimmer denn Polytheismus (širk)« [S. 99, 101].

KAPITEL 4, »*The Use of Biblical Material and Related Issues*« [S. 110-138] weist nach, daß die zunehmende Verfügbarkeit arabischer Bibelübersetzungen nicht quasi automatisch zu besseren Bibelkenntnissen auf muslimischer Seite führte. Die Art und Weise des Umgangs mit dem alttestamentlichen Material und dessen Verarbeitung wurden nach wie vor von den individuellen Interessen des jeweiligen Gelehrten bzw. dem thematischen Charakter seines literarischen Werkes geprägt. Das vornehmliche Interesse der Muslime aber galt jenen Bibelstellen, aus denen — wie zuvor schon die Christen in bezug auf das Wirken Jesu — sie nun ihrerseits frühe Hinweise auf den arabischen Propheten Muḥammad, das »Siegel der Propheten«, herauszulesen meinten.

KAPITEL 5, »*The Proof of the Prophethood*« [S. 139-191], nähert sich der Thematik aus einer anderen Perspektive: Es wird die Frage gestellt, warum die Zahl der gegen den Islam gerichteten apologetischen und polemischen Schriften unter den christlichen Autoren in den ehemals byzantinischen Provinzen (zu denen die Muslime in frühislamischer Zeit eher weniger Kontakte hatten als etwa zu Juden) relativ rasch anwuchs und warum Ähnliches auf jüdischer Seite —

zunächst oder nur scheinbar — fehlte. Den inhaltlichen Schwerpunkt dieses Teils aber bilden die Entwicklungen ab dem Ende des 8. Jahrhunderts, als mit der größeren Zahl jüdischer und christlicher Konvertiten (der Ex-Nestorianer Ibn Rabban ist nur ein Beispiel) sich auch die Bibelkenntnisse sowie die Verfügbarkeit genauerer Bibelübersetzung auf Seiten der Muslime maßgeblich erhöht halten, und somit eine qualitativ neue Situation eingetreten war.

KAPITEL 6, »*The Abrogation of the Mosaic Law*« [S. 192-222] thematisiert die muslimische Auffassung, daß viele Gesetze in der Torah als Strafen Gottes *nur* für die »ungehorsamen« Juden zu verstehen und für Muslime nicht gültig seien. Auch scheint hier das koranische Prinzip des *nash*, d.h. die »Abrogation« (eines Koranverses durch einen anderen), dem muslimischen Verständnis von der Aufhebung biblischer Rechtsprinzipien zugrunde gelegen zu haben.

KAPITEL 7, »*The Question of the Authenticity of the Jewish Scripture*« [S. 223-248] beschreibt und analysiert Verwendung und Umgang der muslimischen Autoren mit der Torah als »Quelle«: So z.B. zitiert Ibn Rabban Bibelstellen unpolemisch; Ibn Qutaiba verwendet die Torah als historisches Dokument. Al-Ya'qūbī oder at-Ṭabarī wiederum berichten von der Vernichtung des Textes und dessen Rekonstruktion in einer, wie sie meinen, allerdings sinnentstellenden Fassung. Nur al-Maqdisī und Ibn Ḥazm sprechen von einer jüdischen Verfälschung des Textes selbst. Ṭabarī beschuldigt in seinem *Tafsīr* die Juden zudem, ihren Bund mit Gott gebrochen zu haben, als sie Muḥammads Prophetentum leugneten und ihn der Lüge bezichtigten. Er sieht in den Animositäten der Juden gegenüber Muḥammad sogar Parallelen zum feindlichen Verhalten der Israeliten gegenüber Moses. Doch es sind insbesondere die Rabbinen (denen schon der Koran vorwirft, ihr Wissen aus Machtgier geheimzuhalten bzw. Gottes Offenbarung mit selbstverfaßten Texten zu verfälschen), die in den Quellen bezichtigt werden, Inhalt und Interpretation der heiligen Schrift zu manipulieren. Wieder ist es der Spanier Ibn Ḥazm, der in diesem Punkt besonders ausführlich ist.

KAPITEL 8, »*Conclusions*« [S. 249-255], komprimiert zentrale Ergebnisse der Untersuchung noch einmal: Danach läßt sich u.a. feststellen, daß die untersuchten Autoren Bibelstellen relativ zahlreich anführen. Die Intentionen dazu erwachsen mehrheitlich aus religionsgeschichtlichem Interesse, das zwar letztlich vor allem apologetischen Zwecken diene, sich aber keinesfalls durchgängig in polemischen Äußerungen artikulierte. Dennoch scheint festzustehen, daß keinem dieser Autoren (viell. mit Ausnahme Ibn Rabbans) eine vollständige Torah-Version zur Verfügung stand. Auch hatte offenbar keiner von ihnen mehr als oberflächliche Hebräisch-Kenntnisse. Bemerkenswert ist, daß gerade Ibn Ḥazm, dessen Polemik das nicht unbedingt vermuten läßt, die bei weitem umfangreichsten Bibelkenntnisse besessen zu haben scheint. Nicht weniger interessant ist der Beleg, daß sich — entgegen gängigen Vorstellungen — schiitische Autoren zumindest ebenso tolerant gegenüber Juden zeigten wie Sunniten.

C. Adang hat den thematischen Rahmen ihrer Untersuchung klar umrissen. Bereits der Buchtitel macht deutlich, daß es ihr um »Muslim writers on Judaism...« geht. Eine überschaubare Auswahl aus der Fülle relevanter Quellen zu treffen, ist also ganz legitim und verständlich. Schade ist allerdings, daß der große Textkorpus des *Hadīth* im Einführungskapitel nur marginal erwähnt wird und in die Untersuchung selbst nicht einbezogen wurde. Zu bedenken ist dabei, daß gerade die *hadīte* — aufgrund ihrer weiten Verbreitung unter den

Muslimen und ihres autoritativen Charakters — Einfluß nicht nur auf die muslimischen Gelehrten ausübten, sondern eine wichtige Rolle im Alltagsbewußtsein der Mehrheit der Muslime spielten. Der Einwand, daß die Verfasser solcher Ḥadīṭ-Sammlungen nicht »Autoren«/»writers« im engeren Sinne, sondern vielmehr »Kompilatoren« waren, die lediglich ältere Texte neu zusammenstellen, ließe sich mit Blick auf den Forschungsstand der modernen Quellenkritik relativieren.

Recherchiert man beispielsweise in den neun anerkannten Standardsammlungen des Ḥadīṭ nach Informationen zum Topos »Verständnis und Kenntnisse der Muslime vom Judentum«, kommt man, statistisch gesehen, zu folgenden Ergebnissen: Das Wortfeld »yahūd, yahūdīya, yahūdī« begegnet in knapp 300 Überlieferungen, die Wurzel y-h-d in 405 Traditionen, die Worte *taurāh* (Torah) bzw. *ahl at-taurāh* (Leute der Torah) an 126 Stellen; die *Banū Isrāʿīl* werden 4 mal erwähnt. Selbst wenn man Mehrfachzitate eines ḥadīṭs abrechnet, ist dieses Textmaterial eindrucksvoll umfangreich.

Doch auch thematische Stichproben im Ḥadīṭ regen dazu an, Adangs hochinteressante Thematik auf diese Textgattung auszuweiten. So erfahren wir aus den Ḥadīṭ-Kompendien zum Beispiel, daß jüdische Vorstellungen die Muslime anregten, sich mit der theologisch relevanten Frage auseinanderzusetzen, ob über Muslime im Grabe gerichtet werde bzw. sie dort gepeinigt würden. Die relevanten Traditionen liefern nicht nur konkrete Informationen zu Kontext und Chronologie der Entwicklung dieses Prinzips in der Anfangszeit des Islam. Sie berichten einmütig, daß es eine Jüdin war, die ʿĀʾīša erstmals mit dieser Problematik konfrontiert hat: Überwiegend geschieht dies durch den frommen Wunsch einer Jüdin (*yahūdīyya*) »Gott möge dich vor den Strafen im Grabe bewahren« (*aʿādaki Allāhummin ʿadābi l-qabr*);¹⁾ an anderer Stelle²⁾ wird ʿĀʾīša im Beisein des Propheten von einer Jüdin (*imraʾa min al-yahūd*) gefragt »Weißt du, daß über die Leute in ihren Gräbern gerichtet wird«. In einer dritten Überlieferung³⁾ sind es zwei betagte Jüdinnen aus Medina (*ʿaḡūzān min ʿuḡuz al-madīna*), die ʿĀʾīša darauf ansprechen. ʿĀʾīša widerspricht ihnen, kann sie aber nicht von ihrer Meinung abringen und befragt später den Propheten. Dieser bestätigt: »Die beiden [Alten] haben die Wahrheit gesagt, sie (d.h. die Insassen des Grabes im allgemeinen) werden [derart] gepeinigt werden, daß es [sogar] die Vögel hören«. Nach der zuvor zitierten Tradition⁴⁾ allerdings wollte der Prophet ʿĀʾīša offenbar zunächst beruhigen mit der Feststellungen, daß die Juden allein diesen Strafen ausgesetzt seien; diese seine Aussage wird jedoch (lt. Text schon wenige Tage nach diesem Gespräch) abrogiert durch die — nichtkoranische — Offenbarung (»*tuftanūna fil-qubūr*«), mit der die Vorstellung vom »Richten im Grabe« zu einem *auch* islamischen Grundsatz erhoben wird. — Aus dem Ḥadīṭ erfahren wir ebenfalls von dem Gebot an die Muslime, sich zu erheben — d.h. sich respektvoll zu verhalten —, [auch] wenn ein jüdischer Leichenzug vorüberzieht. Buḥārī widmet dieser Problematik

sogar ein ganzes Kapitel.⁵⁾ — Rechtsrelevant sind jene *ḥadīṭe*, wonach einige Juden zum arabischen Propheten kamen, um ihn nach der Strafe für einen Mann und eine Frau von den Ihrigen zu fragen, die Ehebruch begingen. Muḥammad läßt sie (in Anspielung auf Koran 3, *Al ʿImrān*, Vers 93) die Torah holen und sich daraus vortragen, welche Strafe dort vorgesehen ist. Dabei wird von einem Juden versucht, den »Steinigungsvers« zu unterschlagen, indem er den Passus mit der Hand verdeckt. Das wird von den Muslimen bemerkt und verlangt, die Juden sollten auch den Steinigungsvers verlesen. Der Prophet ordnet daraufhin an, entsprechend zu verfahren. Der bekannte Prophetengefährte Ibn ʿUmar schließt seinen Ausgezeugenbericht mit den Worten ab: »Und ich sah den [wegen Ehebruchs verurteilen] Juden [noch], wie er sich vor die Frau stellte, um sie [vor den Steinen] zu schützen.«⁶⁾ Erachtet man diese Überlieferung als historisch verwertbare Quelle, erfahren wir aus dieser Episode nicht nur, daß und wie die Muslime in frühester Zeit Rechtsentscheidungen über Juden trafen, sondern auch, daß nach dem Vorbild Muḥammads in diesem Falle die Torah eine zulässige Rechtsquelle ist.

Adangs Studie beschließen drei Appendices und eine umfangreiche Bibliographie. Erstere enthalten — erstmals in englischer Übersetzung — a) eine »Beschreibung des Judentum« von al-Maqdisi, b) einen Auszug aus Ibn Qutaibas »*Dalāʾil an-nubuwwa*« sowie c) ein Verzeichnis der Bibelstellen, die von den Muslimen als Hinweise auf Muḥammads Prophetentum verstanden wurden, mit Querverweisen auf die arabischen Quellen.

Als bibliographische Ergänzung zur Sekundärliteratur sei u.a. hingewiesen auf ISRAEL WOLFENSOHN:⁷⁾ *Taʾrīh al-Yahūd fī bilād al-ʿArab. Fī l-ḡāhiliyya wa-ṣadr al-Islām*. Kairo (Maṭbaʿat al-ʿItimād) 1345/1927 und weitere dort angegebene ältere Literatur; — LEVI, J. JACOB: *The Traditions of al-Bukhari and their Aggadic Parallels*, (Diss. Toronto University) Toronto 1936 (bes. Kap. A II, »Theological Discussions between Jews and Muslims«); — AḤMAD ḤIḠĀZĪ AS-SAQĀ: *al-Biṣāra bi-Banī l-Islām fī t-Taurāh wa-l-Inḡīl*. (Diss. Azhar Universität) Kuliyyat Uṣūl ad-Dīn, Qism ad-ḍaʿwa wa-t-Taḡāfa al-Islāmiyya — 264 S.) Kairo (1975), insbes. die Abschnitte 1-4 über die Torah.

Interessant für die Thematik sind desweiteren Ibn Qayyim al-Ḡauziyya's (st. 751/1350) *Hidāyat al-ḥayārā* (»Die Rechtsleitung der Ratlosen«),⁸⁾ ein Werk der vergleichenden Religionswissenschaft mit durchweg polemischem Charakter, das aber aufgrund seiner sprachlich gekonnten Argumentation großen Einfluß auf (mittelalterliche) Muslime gehabt haben dürfte. Nicht weniger interessant wäre es, die handschriftlich erhaltenen polemischen Werke einiger bei M. STEIN-SCHNEIDER⁹⁾ verzeichneter (vom Judentum zum Islam

1) z.B. *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Buḥārī*, Zählung nach *Fath al-bārī bi-ṣarḥ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Buḥārī ... li-Ibn Ḥaḡar al-ʿAsqalānī* (Beirut 1992), K. al-Ḡumʿa, ḥadīṭ Nr. 1050.

2) *Ṣaʿartī annakum tuftanūna fī l-qubūr?*; vgl. *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, Ed. ʿAbd al-Bāqī (Ed. Kairo 1955-56), K. al-Masāʿid wa-mawāḍiʿ as-ṣalāt, ḥadīṭ Nr. 584.

3) *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, K. al-Masāʿid wa-mawāḍiʿ as-ṣalāt, Nr. 586; vgl. auch *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Buḥārī*, Nr. 6366, und *Sunan an-Nasāʾī* (Ed. Abū Gudda, Beirut 1406/1986), Nr. 2067.

4) *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, Nr. 584.

5) »Bāb man qāma li-ḡanāzat yahūdī«, *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Buḥārī*, Nr. 1311ff. — Vgl. auch *Musnad Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal* (Ed. Iḥyāʾ at-Turāth), *Bāqī Musnad al-Mukattīrīn*, 14018: »inna al-maut^a faza^{um}...«.

6) *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Buḥārī*, Nr. 6819 — *Sunan Abī Dāʾūd*, Ed. M. Muḥīy ad-Dīn b. ʿAbd al-Ḥamīd (Kairo, ca. 1983, »Bāb fī raḡm al-yahūdīyain«, dort Nr., 4446-7.

7) Israil Wolfensohn [Isrāʿīl Wulfinsūn] war aus Jerusalem nach Kairo gekommen, um bei Ṭāhā Husain zu studieren und zu promovieren. Er war dann als Professor für Hebräisch an der *Dār al-ʿUlūm* tätig, bis er in den gegründeten Staat Israel zurückkehrte und in den Staatsdienst trat.

8) Gedr. Kairo (Dār al-Maṭbaʿa as-Salafiyya) 1399/1979.

9) Moritz Steinschneider: *Die Arabische Literatur der Juden. Ein Beitrag zur Literaturgeschichte der Araber, grossenteils aus handschriftlichen Quellen*. Frankfurt a. M. (Verlag von J. Kaufmann) 1902.

konvertierter) Autoren zu untersuchen. Jene Abhandlungen sind mehrheitlich in Arabisch verfaßt, aber mit hebräischen Lettern geschrieben: so die *Maqāla fī l-radd 'alā l-Yahūd* des Mosuler Arztes (Ibn) Kusin (Qūṣūn?) (st. um 360/370),¹⁰⁾ und 'Abd al-Haqq al-Islāmī's (st. um 1310-30 in Nordwestafrika) Schrift gegen die Juden, »worin Bibelcitate in hebr. Sprache mit arab. Schrift gegeben sind.«¹¹⁾ Sa'd Ibn Kamūna's (13. Jh.) »Kritik der Untersuchung ... über die drei Religionen« behandelt — nach STEINSCHNEIDER — die Problematik »mit einer für jene Zeit auffallenden Objectivität« und stellt die »vielleicht interessanteste unter den arab. Streitschriften zwischen den Religionen« dar.¹²⁾ Yahyà b. Ibrāhīm b. 'Umar ar-Rāqilī (aus Spanien oder Marokko, st. 808/1405) wiederum verfaßte den gegen die Juden gerichteten Traktat »Bestätigung der Religion« und das Werk »Disputation mit den Juden und Christen«.¹³⁾

Halle (Saale), September 1997

Sebastian GÜNTHER

* *
*

GALLAGHER, Nancy Elizabeth — Approaches to the History of the Middle East. Ithaca Press, London, 1996. (24 cm, VIII, 197). ISBN 0-86372-212-1. £ 12.95.

The main substance of the book consists of interview with eight senior historians of the Middle East, "who", Mrs Gallagher writes in her preface, "have lived through and participated in the major historical and historiographical transitions of the post-World War II era, and who have influenced English-speaking students." The eight historians are: Albert Hourani, Charles Issawi, André Raymond, Afaf Lutfi al-Sayyid Marsot, Maxime Rodinson, Nikki Keddie, Halil Inalcik, Abdul-Karim Rafeq.

The author's Introduction gives an exposé of the changes which have affected the study of Middle Eastern and African history since World War I. After World War II attention shifted from focusing on the Islamic civilization as an analytical unit to a geographical unit. The opening of archives to Western scholars was an important development for historical research. On the other hand basic assumptions of Western scholars were being questioned, first by Waardenburg in his *l'Islam dans le miroir de l'Occident* and later by Edward W. Said in his *Orientalism*. The Introduction is an extremely insightful piece of research, it should be said.

The interviews are of a different kind. The strictness of the learned discourse gives way to a more informal approach though not without system. The interviewer has managed to present a text, which is not only "lively, engaging, and accessible to students" (p. vii), but also enlightening as regards the methodological and philosophical approaches to the study of history of each of the eight interviewees. A book to be commended warmly to students of Middle Eastern and North African history.

Leiden, August 1997

C. NIJLAND

* *
*

INGHAM, Bruce — Nadji Arabic: Central Arabian. (London Oriental and African Language Library, 1). John Benjamins Publishing Co., Amsterdam, 1994. (23 cm, XVI, [2], 216). ISBN 90-272-3801-4 (Eur). ISBN 1-55619-725-X (US). HFL. 110; \$ 62.00.

The author of the book under review here is a renowned specialist of the dialects of Saudi Arabia about which in spite of a recent upsurge in publications (Rosenhouse 1984; Prochazka 1988; Sawayan 1992; Kurpershoek 1994) much remains unknown. He has written books on the dialects of North East Arabia (1982) and the traditions of the Bedouin of Northern Arabia (1986), and at an earlier stage on the related dialects of Khuzestan (1973, 1976) and the scarcely known dialect of Mecca (1971).

The present book is the first volume of a new series, the *London Oriental and African Language Library*, whose aim is to give accurate and up-to-date descriptions of a large number of Asian and African languages. The format makes clear that the emphasis is on the structural description of the languages involved. After a brief introduction on the population of the Naǧd region in Northern Arabia and the relationship between the Naǧdī dialect and other Saudi Arabian dialects, subsequent chapters deal with phonology, morphology, sentence structure, the noun phrase structure, number and gender, the verb transitivity system, the tense/aspect system, modality, and time and condition structures. The book is rounded off by two texts, and two appendices on the lexicon and dialect differences. At the end of the book there is list of references and a general index.

The Naǧdī dialects are very much the focus of interest of Arabic dialectologists, partly because of their conservative character and partly because of their preservation of an oral culture represented by an extensive body of traditional storytelling and poetry in the Bedouin style. Collections of various tribes have appeared in the work of Sawayan (1992) and Kurpershoek (1994). Their intrinsic linguistic interest derives from their relationship with other modern dialects. They retain some features which other Arabic dialects have lost and belong to the most conservative group of Arabic dialects. The following morphological features may be mentioned in this respect: the retention of a productive internal passive; the retention of a productive causative measure of the verb; the occurrence of *tanwīn* vestiges in the form of an indefinite ending *-in*. In their syntax, too, they exhibit a number of interesting features, in particular in the aspectual system, which is basically that of Classical Arabic, while the typical durative particles of other dialects are absent.

The treatment of the tense and aspect system of Naǧdī Arabic in the book under review here (87-148) is particularly enlightening and definitely more complete and instructive than the average dialect description. I should like to elaborate here on the distinction of *Aktionsart* made by the author. Such a distinction is almost never made explicit, let alone argued by writers of dialect descriptions. According to Ingham (pp. 89ff.) the verbs in Naǧdī Arabic can be divided into two main classes, 'action verbs', e.g., *kitab* "to write", and 'state/motion verbs', e.g., *ga'ad* "to sit" and *rāḥ* "to go". The semantic difference between the two classes is argued for on syntactic grounds, more specifically on the different function of the participle within the two classes. The participle of action verbs denotes a perfective aspect, e.g., *kātib* "having written", whereas the participle of state/motion verbs denotes a present continuous, e.g., *rāyih* "going". As a result

¹⁰⁾ a.a.O., S. 95 (§ 52 b).

¹¹⁾ a.a.O., S. 166 (§ 126).

¹²⁾ a.a.O., S. 240 (§ 178, 8).

¹³⁾ a.a.O., S. 171 (§ 137).

the imperfect form of the state/motion verbs (e.g., *yrûh*) cannot denote a present continuous as with the action verbs.

Ingham himself refers to an alternative hypothesis which would conflate the two categories (p. 91): if the participle *râyiḥ* were to be interpreted as “having set in motion [and therefore going]”, and *gâ'id* as “having sat down [and therefore sitting]”, these forms would be perfective as well so that the main difference between the action verbs and the class/motion verbs would disappear. He himself rules this possibility out, however. In his interpretation of the alternative hypothesis the basic meaning of the verbs in question would have to be inceptive. But such a basic meaning is contradicted by the non-inceptive meaning of these verbs in cases like *anâm sa'tên kill yôm* “I sleep for two hours each day” (which obviously does not mean ‘I am falling asleep for two hours each day’).

I am not completely convinced by Ingham’s argumentation concerning the necessity of distinguishing between the two categories of verbs. In the case of verbs like *waḡf* “to stop” and *ga'ad* “to sit” Ingham’s analysis would seem to imply that their imperfect can only have a habitual meaning, as in the *nâm* sentence quoted above, rather than a present continuous. Their participles are then free for the present continuous meaning. But in Gulf Arabic (cf. Holes 1990:195) *tôguf* means both “he stops (habitually)” and “he is (in the action of) stopping”. The question therefore is whether *anâm* in Naḡdî Arabic could also mean “he is falling asleep”, for instance in “he (habitually) falls asleep at the beginning of each lecture” or “he is (in the action of) falling asleep”. A similar question could be asked about *tala'*: can *yiṭla'* mean “he is ascending” or “he is setting off to ascend”? If the answer is affirmative then the real semantic distinction within the verbs would seem to be one between verbs having both punctual and durative meaning, and those having only durative meaning. As a matter of fact, this is the distinction Holes posits for Gulf Arabic.

I may add that in Gulf Arabic the ingressive meaning of verbs like *'araf* “to know” seems to be expressed (sometimes?) by periphrasis with auxiliaries such as *šâr* (Holes 1990:196). This would seem to indicate that in Gulf Arabic the perfect of these verbs is losing its inceptive meaning and that Gulf Arabic is shifting towards a new categorisation.

The explanation of the different treatment of the participle in the two verbal classes posited by Ingham may very well lie in the diachronic development of the participial form. In Classical Arabic, according to the Arabic grammarians, the participle may have both perfective and future meaning, depending on the case of its complement. In *huwa kâtibu l-kitâbi* the meaning is perfective “he has written the book, he is the author of the book”, but in *huwa kâtibun al-kitâba* the meaning is “he is going to write the book”. With the disappearance of the case system the distinction between the two constructions became blurred. Since action verbs like *kataba* prototypically have a direct object, their participles developed a perfective meaning, whereas the participles of motion verbs such as *râḥa* became associated with a future meaning. In the course of time this future meaning must then have extended towards the present continuous. This is precisely where the aspectual system as set up by Ingham remains somewhat unclear. What exactly is the present continuous of a verb such as *râḥ* or *tala'*? “Being in the act of moving” or “intending to reach a certain goal”?

Within the category of the state/motion verbs I am not certain how Ingham handles the distinction between inceptive and non-inceptive verbs. In the case of *ga'ad* it would seem to me that the only meaning the perfect can have is punctual/inceptive: “he sat down”. For “he was sitting” I assume that in Naḡdî Arabic the participle should be used, *kân gâ'id*, although this is not stated explicitly by Ingham. Similarly one would expect *kân lâbis* “he was wearing” as against *libas* “he put on, dressed”, and *kân 'arif* “he knew” as against *'araf* “he came to know, recognised”, at least that is what the use of these verbs in Classical Arabic suggests. If this assumption is correct, there is a semanto-syntactic distinction between state and motion verbs and the two groups of verbs represent different *Aktionsarte*.

Two brief critical comments should be made in connection with the treatment of the tense/aspect/*Aktionsart* system. In the first place I should like to draw attention to a paragraph on p. 109, in which the author traces non-Arabian dialect influences. It appears that the speakers of Naḡdî Arabic especially in contacts with foreigners Egyptianise their dialect, using forms such as *ḥa-ykun waṣil* “he will have arrived”, *mâ kint šiftih* “I did not know him”. Such forms do not occur in the texts recorded by the authors and are not used by the speakers among themselves. According to the author they can more easily be elicited in English than in the ‘pure’ Naḡdî forms because they “reflect the English type in giving explicit marking of time”. Without more details it is difficult to assess this claim. One could perhaps also speculate that such Egyptianised forms are regarded by the speakers as the appropriate forms for communication with foreigners, especially when these foreigners have demonstrated their knowledge of Arabic. A similar situation obtains in Yemen where every non-Yemenite foreigner with any knowledge of Arabic is automatically classified as an Egyptian. The Egyptian dialect seems to function as some kind of prestige variety to be used in contacts with this particular class of foreigners (cf. Diem 1973:15-19).

My second remark concerns a slightly critical evaluation of the theories of the Arabic grammarians by Ingham (p. 110). In connection with the treatment of the *ḥâl* construction he refers to what he calls “their generally atomistic approach to language concentrating more on particles than on structures”. On behalf of the Arabic grammarians I should like to emphasise that far from occupying themselves with single context-free particles they always concentrated on the function of words within a structure. The basis of their theories is constituted by the principle of syntactic dependency (*'amal*), which is the organising force in any utterance.

The preceding remarks just go to show that the more one writes on a subject, the more opportunities for criticism one offers to others. Ingham’s book is an excellent example of a dialect description that goes far beyond the usual focus on phonological and morphological details. He does treat these aspects of the dialect structure, but reserves much more space to a linguistically interesting analysis of the syntactic constraints and constructions of Naḡdî Arabic, thereby making his study relevant for both Arabic dialectologists and general linguists. His data all derive from fieldwork, as the examples make clear. As a result, the usual intrusion of Classicisms in dialect descriptions is largely absent: the author has clearly worked with informants, who did not attempt to upgrade their speech when speaking with him, doubtless because his knowledge of the Saudi dialects made it possible for him to

adapt to their colloquial dialect. In short, this book represents a valuable analysis of a modern Arabic dialect, which I wholeheartedly recommend to all those who work in this field.

Nijmegen, June 1997

Kees VERSTEEGH

Bibliographical references

- Diem, Werner. 1973. *Skizzen jemenitischer Dialekte*. Beirut & Wiesbaden: F. Steiner.
- Holes, Clive. *Gulf Arabic*. London & New York: Routledge, 1990.
- Ingham, Bruce. 1971. "Some characteristics of Meccan Arabic". *BSOAS* 34.273-97.
- . 1973. "Urban and rural Arabic in Khuzistan". *BSOAS* 36.533-53.
- . 1976. "Regional and social factors in the dialect geography of Southern Iraq and Khuzistan". *BSOAS* 39.62-82.
- . 1982. *North-east Arabian Dialects*. London & Boston: Kegan Paul International.
- . 1986. *Bedouin of Northern Arabia: Traditions of the Âl-Dhafir*. London: KPI.
- Kurpershoek, Marcel. 1994. *The Poetry of ad-Dindân: A Bedouin bard in Saudi Arabia*. Leiden: E.J. Brill.
- Prochazka, Theodore. 1988. *Saudi Arabian Dialects*. London & New York: Kegan Paul International.
- Rosenhouse, Judith. 1984. *The Bedouin Arabic Dialects: General problems and a close analysis of North Israel Bedouin dialects*. Wiesbaden: O. Harrassowitz.
- Sowayan, S.A. 1992. *The Arabian Oral Historical Narrative: An ethnographic and linguistic analysis*. Wiesbaden: O. Harrassowitz.

* *
*

SADGROVE, P.C. — *The Egyptian Theatre in the Nineteenth Century (1799-1882)*. Ithaca Press, London, 1996. (24 cm, X, 214). ISBN 0-86372-202-4. £35.00.

Egypt can boast of having two theatrical traditions: an old indigenous tradition and a more recent one, imported from the West in the last century. The main difference is the level of institutionalisation of the genre. Egypt, nor in fact the rest of the Arabic world, never knew the conventions of a theatre building divided into a stage and an auditorium, with its particular etiquettes, until Napoleon Bonaparte invaded the country (1798-1801). The question of why 'theatre' as the West knew it had never developed in the Arabic world before the invasion has produced a great deal of speculation among scholars. Some have pointed out that theatre did exist by trying to prove the existence of dramatic elements in prose and poetry. They concentrated mainly on drama, the literary aspects of the complex cultural genre we call 'theatre'.

The same can be said about the study of modern Egyptian-Arabic theatre following the adoption of western conventions, as most studies up till now have focused on drama. Other aspects of theatre such as the financial situation of theatre companies and how this affects their choice of productions, the position of the authorities, or the reception by audiences, critics and authorities have often taken second place. And so, the history of modern Egyptian-Arabic theatre has essentially been a succession of plays and playwrights, basically because of a lack of knowledge of theatrical elements.

Fortunately, there have been exceptions to this general rule. A recent study by Shmuel Moreh, *Live Theatre and*

Dramatic Literature in the Medieval Arab World (New York, 1992), shows that the Arab world has a long history of various forms of theatrical performance. With respect to modern Egyptian-Arabic theatre, Muhammad Yusuf Najm, in his excellent study *al-Masrahîya fi 'l-Adab al-'Arabî al-Hadîth* (Beirut, 1956), showed the way both for dramatic and for theatrical elements. This book covers the period from the 1840s — when Mârûn an-Naqqâsh in Beirut first attempted to create genuine Arabic theatre inspired by western tradition — until 1914 when this theatre had firmly taken root in Egypt. Najm not only presents a detailed list of the plays staged in the nineteenth century, but he also describes the activities by the early theatre companies. Little is known about Egypt's 'roaring twenties', despite the efforts of Ramsîs 'Awad, the author of the comprehensive *Mawsû'at al-Masrah al-Misrî al-Biblîyûjirâfiyah* (Cairo, 1983), which lists around 4000 items. 'Awad accomplished the gargantuan task of collecting almost all announcements of performances, reviews, and articles in the Egyptian press from 1900 until 1930. Both works are of great importance for the study of modern Egyptian-Arabic theatre, the more so because the primary sources, the (early) Egyptian-Arabic periodicals, are subject to decay.

Another exception is the work under review. *The Egyptian Theatre in the Nineteenth Century* deals with all the different aspects of the world of theatre in Egypt between 1799 and 1882. P.C. Sadgrove stresses the problems of sources that have gone missing: "Even some of the periodicals used by this researcher, because of neglect and deterioration, may not be available to future scholars. The value of newspapers and magazines to cultural and social history has up to now not been properly appreciated by many Middle Eastern libraries, which have been dilatory in their conservation efforts" (p. vii).

Thanks to thorough research of European and Arab publications which appeared in Egypt in the last century, Sadgrove has preserved important data about theatrical activities in Egypt. Moreover, he also managed to dig up several accounts from Europeans who witnessed Egyptian performances, accounts that had been overlooked by other researchers.

The book is divided into five chapters. Following a short introduction on the subject in *Chapter One*, the author describes in *Chapter Two* the various forms of "traditional Arabic drama" such as the shadow theatre, puppet shows, impromptu farcical performances presented by travelling players, and popular entertainment at public and private venues, including performances by conjurers, (street)singers, acrobats, and dancers.

Chapter Three focuses on European-style theatre in Egypt, but also dwells on the views of two Egyptian intellectuals of the time (*Rifâ'ah al-Tahtâwî* and *'Alî Mubâarak*) on the phenomenon of European theatre. The chapter presents information about the first theatre building in Egypt, "Napoleon's theatre", constructed in 1799 in Cairo, and about European amateur theatricals in Alexandria and Cairo. It describes the efforts of 'europeanizer' Khedive Ismâ'îl to build an Opera house, a 'Théâtre de la Comédie', and a French Cirque on the occasion of the opening of the Suez Canal in 1869, and presents new data about Giuseppe Verdi's *Aida* (which, contrary to widespread belief, was not intended for the opening of the Suez Canal). In addition, it lists the first translations into Arabic of European libretti and plays, and the Khedivial subsidies to the European theatre in Cairo.

Chapter Four deals with the first experiments by James Sanua (Ja'qûb Sanû' (or Sannû'??)) to create an Egyptian theatre.

Much has already been written about the activities of this playwright, actor, director and producer between 1870 and 1872/3, yet Sadgrove presents new information about this period. This chapter gives new data on the Egyptian adaptations of European comedies (in particular Molière) rendered in the Egyptian colloquial by Muhammad ʿUthmân Jalâl in the 1870s. A separate paragraph deals with the staging of the three-act play *Layla* in 1872, written by an al-Azhar shaykh and performed on Sanua's stage by al-Azhar students. This play is believed to have been the first tragedy performed in the Arabic language in Egypt.

The last chapter describes the activities of Syrian emigrants who came to Egypt after the late 1870s. They were to dominate the theatrical scene in Egypt until the end of the century. Sadgrove chose to end his study with the so-called ʿUrâbî revolt in 1882, which triggered a period of political instability that would paralyse theatrical activities for several years.

Three (annotated) original texts are included in as many appendices: the "circular enclosing police regulations respecting the Italian theatre in Alexandria" (1847); the part from James Sanua's (short) memoirs concerning the theatre, and a first proposal to create a national theatre (1872).

Reviews often end with hackneyed sentences like "this work is valuable contribution to the study of...", but the cliché does seem to apply to Sadgrove's study. For the reasons mentioned above — his collection of new and detailed information and its preservation — this study deserves to be called a valuable contribution to the reconstruction of the development of modern Egyptian theatre. In his preface, Sadgrove informs the reader that it is impossible to present a more or less complete reconstruction: "The historian of the early days of the modern Egyptian theatre faces the dilemma of a severe shortage of source material; what he ends up writing is inevitably a half-complete picture of dramatic activity in the country where the modern Arab theatre was to put down its strongest roots" (p. vii). This "half-complete picture" however is probably the best one can get. For this reason the author may have decided to gather all the data about theatre he could find, however scattered and contradicting they may be. He should be credited for this and for being very careful not to jump to conclusions or to make hasty assumptions. Still, the various topics are sometimes presented in a slightly haphazard fashion. On more than one occasion, the text requires a second reading in order to get a clear sense of a particular subject or about the chronology of related matters. The chapter on James Sanua, in particular, lacks cohesion, which could have been avoided by more careful editing.

Amsterdam, June 1997

Rianne TAMIS

* *
*

GALMÉS de FUENTES, Alvaro — El amor cortés en la lírica árabe y en la lírica provençal. (Crítica y Estudios Literarios). Ediciones Catedra, s.a., Madrid, 1996. (21 cm, 158, front.). ISBN 84-376-1453-8.

Many books, comments, articles and notes have been written on the comparison of Arab love lyrics and Provençal court lyrics, the subject of the book under review. This comparison is seen especially relevant for the unsolved problem of the origin and sudden rise of the first European medieval

love lyric, that of the Provençal or Occitan troubadours, before the French had taken possession of the lands where the languages of Oc were spoken, and the Occitan language had suddenly developed into a literary language which was used not only in Aquitania and Provence, but also on a large scale at the courts of Spain and Italy. The influence of Occitan love lyrics on Western Europe was conspicuous: in Germany and France translations were made and metrical forms adopted, and Italy and Galicia/Portugal developed their own love lyrics, in which the contribution of Occitan lyrics was deeply felt. Outstanding authors from world literature, such as Dante Alighieri (1266-1321), were influenced in their primary outlook by the lyricism of the troubadours. But Arabic love poetry is not quite the same as Occitan love lyrics, and the two lyrical traditions are not the same, although all love lyrics throughout the world do have something in common. Therefore the discussion of the differences and the parallels will never end, and the theory of the Arabic origin of troubadour lyrics will remain one of the prevalent theories, along with the theory of the Classical influence or the influence of medieval Latin poetry or liturgical church poetry.

The author of the present book, Álvaro Galmés de Fuentes, is well-known for his publications on early Spanish language. He was influenced by the illustrious Arabist Emilio García Gómez, who died a few years ago within sight of his ninetyeth birthday. Perhaps for that reason Galmés' book makes a somewhat obsolete impression: it is a repetition of the old arguments and a compendium of possible thematic analogies between Occitan and Arab lyrics, without coming up with new theories or insights. At the end of this review I will list some recent publications which are relevant to the problem, but which are not mentioned in this book.

After a first preliminary note the author dedicates the first chapter to "Court love in the Arabic world", starting with the pre-Islamic period, followed by an exposé of courtly love in the Hijaz in the 7th and 8th centuries, in Iraq in the 8th century, Baghdad in the 9th century, and then courtly love in al-Andalus (pp. 9-16).

The author deals in the second chapter with the poetic 'codex' of Arabic court lyrics, which is subdivided into the beloved woman; obedience and amorous servitude; joyful suffering; unrequited love; pure love; love's secret; falling in love because of hearsay; the theme of dawn; the wind who brings messages; the spring introduction; disturbing groups of lovers; and effects of love (pp. 17-60).

The third chapter is devoted to the connection between court lyrics and troubadoursque lyrics and the question of how a quite new lyric came into being and whose possible influence we could discern (pp. 61-70).

The fourth chapter repeats the categories of the second chapter, but this time with reference to Provençal lyrics: superiority of the beloved; love service and obedience; pleasant suffering; unrequited love; pure love (*fin' amors*); love secret; infatuation because of hearsay; the theme of day-break; the wind as a messenger; the evocation of spring; a disturbing multitude of lovers; the effects of love; courteous and non-courteous love; and other similarities, the terms *joven* and *midons*, 'technical Arabisms' (*trobar*, *gazel*) and names of musical instruments of Arab origin. The phenomenon of troubadour boasting reminds him of Arabic *fakhr*. Furthermore, the author analyses the resemblance between the *senhal* of the troubadours and the Arabic *kunya*, and the martyrdom in love in both cultures (pp. 71-152).

In his conclusion the author formulates several hypotheses about the origin of the love lyrics of the troubadours. 1) the troubadours spontaneously invented their songs; 2) the songs of the troubadours are a development of the pre-troubadouresque poetic tradition; and 3) the troubadours took over a model of foreign origin: the Classical Latin literature; medieval Latin literature; liturgical hymns; Arabic erotic lyrics. The author does not believe in the spontaneous generation of troubadour lyrics: every plant has to have its seed. He quotes Peter Dronke, apparently without agreement, that sentiments and conceptions of courtly love are “universally possible..., possible at any time or place and on any level in society”.

After discarding the argument of polygenesis, the author says that one could think that the songs of the troubadours were merely a development of traditional pre-troubadouresque literature. Leaving aside that such an explanation would make us think about a long and gradual development — which cannot explain the sudden and perfect expansion from the beginning — today this explanation offers us other difficulties. In fact, along with the French *refrains* of popular poetry, the Gallego-Portuguese *cantos de amigo*, and the Castilian *villancicos* we possess nowadays a small corpus of This traditional pre-troubadouresque Romance lyric, namely the so-called *jarchas mozárabes*. The author says that he analysed them and determined their contents as representing an amorous code very similar to that of the genre of the *Chanson de l'Amour*, the *canCIÓN de doncella* or the *canto de amigo*, totally different from Arabic erotic lyrics as well as from Provençal lyrics, because the *jarchas mozárabes* consist of simple love complaints, placed in the mouth of a girl, something that is not usual in Arabic lyrics or in that of the troubadours. But the author affirms that the so-called *jarchas mozárabes* represent a pre-courtly lyric genre, testimony to a very old tradition. Hardly any elements characteristic of the courtly genre occur in the themes of the *jarchas mozárabes*. Therefore, the author says, we cannot consider traditional Romance lyrics as the antecedent of Provençal lyrics. So the author concludes that the third hypothesis is the most likely. Without the need to exclude any of the mentioned suppositions from his third hypothesis, the author believes that Provençal lyrics, as courtly lyrics, cannot be free from the influence of Arabic love poetry. The author thinks that he offers everywhere in his book enough examples of comparable poetic passages from Arabic and Provençal literature to establish an historic link between Arabic love poetry (starting even from pre-Islamic times) and troubadour lyric, which develops the court love theory only many centuries later. In fact, Arabic as well as Provençal court lyrics exalt the spiritual and refined aspect of love, the pure love (*fin' amors*), i.e. the love which consists of humble submission, without hope of recompense, the love without hope, as a pleasant torment, which takes the honest poets of courtly love very far, which is completely different from Greek-Latin culture.

The Latin poet Ovid wanted to teach the lover an ingenious method to seduce the *puellae* and *dominae* by means of flattery, presents, feigned services of trivial humiliations. According to the author, it is certain that some illustrious Romanists (such as M. Delbouille) have tried to establish a direct relation between Ovid's doctrine and Provençal courtly love, but they have only noticed ‘some apparent concomitances, such as the total submission to the god of Love, the despair of the lover whose love is not requited, the idea that

love is the source of valour, the exaltation of love service, the religious respect for the lady who is compared with a goddess. But in Latin erotic poetry, the religious respect for the lady has no aim other than flattery, in order to obtain favours. In any case, here we are concerned with isolated thematic motifs which do not form a poetic code.

On the other hand, the goliards' love songs are far from being courtly poetry: they only express natural passion, and women are only celebrated as sexual objects. Liturgical hymns do not have much to do with love poetry either. In most cases there are only vague metrical resemblances.

According to the author, the sentiment of passionate love, which existed in the Arabic world, was one that had not yet found an equal in Western European cultures. According to the author, isolated cases do not prove the point; only the accumulation of examples will do so. Therefore the author argues against Aurelio Roncaglia who established a causal relationship between the thematic motif of “the wind as a messenger” of Arabic love poetry and that of Provençal poetry, quoting some isolated examples.

The author stresses that already in the sixteenth century the author stresses that already in the sixteenth century the Arabic influence on the troubadours was accepted, and that nowadays many people say that Provençal poetry owes something — perhaps much — to Arabic literature¹⁾ (quoting F. Dakley).

The author does not have any doubt about the strong impact of Arabic love poetry, because the Romance and the West-European world are very familiar with the Islamic world which appears through the Arabic influence in the field of narratives, philosophy and science. However, one must not confuse Arab influence with Arab origin. The author wants to emphasise that recognizing the Arabic influence on Romance poetry does not exclude other influences.

This booklet deals with a popular subject, and therefore it is easy to quote secondary literature which the author either did not take into consideration or did not know about or overlooked. He did not take into account some arguments dealt with in recent scholarly contributions. For instance, Suzanne Enderwitz's *Liebe als Beruf. Al-Abbas ibn al-Ahnaf und das Gazal* (Beirut: Orient-Institut der DMG, [Stuttgart,] Franz Steiner, 1995) and her earlier article ‘Gazal und hoefische Liebe’ (ZDMG 24 suppl. Deutscher Orientalistentag. Stuttgart 1990, 174-83) which points to the difference between Arabic and troubadour poetry. She concluded that Arabic love (i.e. love passion of supposedly Bedouin origin, A.S.) has no fixed connection with court, and consists of the rejection of the urban Muslim conception of virility, and possession of women. She emphasizes the antagonism between Bedouin love and unromantic sedentary love (see our dichotomy ‘chaste love’ versus ‘impudent love’ below).

The case of ‘Abbas ibn al-Ahnaf has also been dealt with by Daniela Beissel (a student of Renate Jacobi — another important scholar of *ghazal* — at Saarbrücken University), in her article on ‘‘Abbas ibn al-Ahnaf, the Courtly poet’, JAL vol. 24 (1993), pp. 1-10. She makes the connection with the troubadours, with a more positive conclusion than Enderwitz as far as the likenesses between the lyrical conceptions are concerned.²⁾

¹⁾ See also A.R. Nykl, *Hispano-Arabic Poetry and its Relations with the Old Provençal Troubadours*, Baltimore 1946, p. XI [Foreword].

²⁾ Some of the older, obsolete arguments are repeated in Abdul-Wahid Lúlúa, ‘Courtly Love: Arabian or European?’, in *Proceedings of the XIIIth Congress of the ICLA München 1988, 1990* (Iudicium Verlag) Vol. 4, pp. 390-96.

We missed this kind of typology of individual Arabic poets in the present book by Galmes de Fuentes. Although he mentions the development of love lyrics in one of the chapters, in giving his examples he does not differentiate enough between the individual Arab love poets or between the two main streams of love poets. Even as late as the time of Ibn Khafajah, the Arab poets were conscious of the essential dichotomy of love, the chaste love [*al-hubb al-'afif*] of the 'Udhrites and the impudent love [*al-hubb al-majin*] of many other poets, starting with Imru'ul-Qays and 'Umar ibn Abi Rabi'ah on the *majin* side and Jamil Buthayna on the 'afif side.

Galmes de Fuentes speaks about courtly amorous codes. Except in a limited number of cases, such as perhaps that of al-'Abbas ibn al-Ahnaf,³⁾ we are dealing with poets who only use a stock of conventional amorous themes, not necessarily leading to a uniform amorous code for Arab love poets. The cases of al-'Abbas ibn Ahnaf and, let us say, the later Sevillian poet Ibn Sahl (1212-1251), show how individual love poets can develop their own system of love poetry, with their own recurrent elements. So there may be a large difference between individual poets. The same perhaps holds true for Occitan love poetry, which differs from individual to individual: the impudent Guilhelm de Peitieu (1071-1126) may have a totally different inspiration than the more serious Bernart de Ventadorn (ca. 1147-1170). If there are likenesses between Arabic and Occitan love poetry then it is perhaps on the thematic and — even more — on the formal level. As far as this last aspect is concerned, Gregor Schoeler in particular has done much research on the possible influence of strophic Arabic structures upon structures in Occitan poetry.⁴⁾

I should also like to mention some thematic differences between Arabic and Occitan love poetry: drinking wine and love for boys does not play a role in any Occitan love poem, whereas in ninth-century Arabic poetry these genres (love and wine-drinking poems) have a tendency to merge: the boy who pours the wine is often the object of love, and it is often difficult for the poetic persona to choose between the real wine and the 'wine' of the lad's cheeks. This (homosexual or pederastic) aspect has been overlooked or ignored by Galmes de Fuentes and other defenders of the Arabic thesis.

As Aurelio Roncaglia pointed out some decades ago, borrowing motifs from other literature is always possible, but the borrowed elements, when used in another poetic system, are reinterpreted by another sensibility which is not only different because there are differences from poet to poet, but also because the poets in question belong to another literary civilisation.⁵⁾

In fact, I think, purporting a connection between Arabic poetry and a totally different kind of poetry, the Occitan poetry,

may attract a lot of scepticism, not only because of some different images or settings,⁶⁾ but also in view of the fact that Arabic poetry had developed over a period of more than five centuries from a Bedouin poetry to an urban one, from a poetry in archaic intertribal Arabic into a highly sophisticated manneristic and baroque poetry in the Classical Arabic language, a language distilled by grammarians and poets, which contrasts with the more naïve and primordial Occitanian poetic system.

Notwithstanding this fact, we know that occasionally Arabic lines were translated into Latin.⁷⁾ Themes from different kinds of literature can have an impact on each other. Perhaps the Arabic theme of the wind as a messenger from the beloved influenced Occitan lyrics, as Aurelio Roncaglia pointed out. What struck Aurelio Roncaglia was the 'typicality' of the images in the motif of the lover who breathes voluptuously the wind which comes from the far abode of the beloved.⁸⁾ The twelfth-century Arab anthologist Ibn Bassam mentions one of the occasions of contact by which Arabic influence can be admitted: he tells how Ibn al-Kattani al-Mutabbib heard female slaves singing in the palace of the count of Castile Sancho García (995-1017) which the caliph of Cordoba had bestowed upon him.⁹⁾ The next of the song started with the mentioned motif. This could be one of the likely connections between Arabic and Romance poetry.¹⁰⁾

Although Galmes de Fuentes stresses the comparison between both lyrics in the domain of amorous codes and the accumulation of likenesses between themes and motifs, the proofs about the Arabic influence on Occitan lyrics are not convincingly given. However, the present book may be regarded as a way to introduce the public at large to the question and to acquaint them with Occitan and Arabic poetry. The discussion presented in his book, however, is not up to date and some of the more recent publications in the field have been ignored.

Amsterdam, 14 August 1997

Arie SCHIPPERS

* *
*

DOW, Martin — *The Islamic Baths of Palestine*. (British Academy Monographs in Archaeology, 7). Oxford University Press, London, 1996. (30 cm, 128, ill., fotogr., tab.). ISBN 0-19-727006-9.

The baths described in this succinct monograph are the Mamluk and Ottoman steam baths (*ḥammāms*) of the former British Mandate, the boundaries of which now include Israel

³⁾ Especially S. Enderwitz in her above-mentioned book speaks in the case of 'Abbas ibn al-Ahnaf about 'behaviour models'. She concludes (p. 248) that that "his love shows [him] at the point of intersection between the two behaviour models, *futuwwa* and *zarf* [...] The love of all-'Abbas corresponds to the conception of service which belongs to *futuwwa*. Elevation through love comes true only by humiliating oneself before one's mistress..."

⁴⁾ Gregor Schoeler, "Die hispano-arabische Strophendichtung. Entstehung und Beziehung zur Troubadourlyrik", *Actes du 8ième Congrès del' U. E., A. I., Aix-en-Provence 1976*, Aix-en-Provence 1978, 243-266. Idem, "Muwashshah und Zadjal", in: Wolfhart Heinrichs, ed., *Neues Handbuch der Literaturwissenschaft*, Bd. V: *Orientalisches Mittelalter*, Wiesbaden (Aula) 1991, 440-464; idem., "The Origins of the Poetic Forms of the Troubadours: the Liturgical and Arabic Theories", *Poesía estrófica árabe y hebrea y sus paralelos romances (Madrid, diciembre de 1989)*, Madrid 1991, 325-335.

⁵⁾ A. Roncaglia, "La lirica arabo-iberica e il sorgere della lirica romanza fuori della penisola iberica", in: *XII Convegno Volta*, Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei, Roma-Firenze 1956, Rome, p. 343.

⁶⁾ See e.g. Jarir Abu Haidar, "The Lack of Metaphorical Affinity between the Muwassahat and the Early provençal Lyrics", in *Poesía estrófica árabe y hebrea y sus paralelos romances*, Madrid, 1991, eds. F. Corriente & A. Sáenz Badillos, pp. 162-173; T.J. Gorton, "Arabic influence on the troubadours: documents and directions", *Journal of Arabic Literature* 5 (1974), pp. 11-16.

⁷⁾ For instance, in the *Disciplina Clericalis* by Petrus Alphonsi (gest. ca. 1140).

⁸⁾ Roncaglia, "La litrica..", p. 338.

⁹⁾ Roncaglia, "La lirica..", p. 339; Ibs Bassam, *al-Dhakhira fi mahasin ahl al-jazira*, ed. I. Abbas, Beyrouth 1979, Vol. III, i, p. 318.

¹⁰⁾ Roncaglia, "La lirica..", pp. 342-343; see also Jean-Marie D'Heur, 'Le motif du vent venu du pays de l'être aimé, l'invocation au vent, l'invocation aux vagues' *Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie* 88 (1972), pp. 69-104, mentioned by Roy Rosenstein, "Andalusian and Troubadour Love-Lyric from Source-Seeking to Comparative Analysis" in *Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie*, Bd. 106 (1990), pp. 338-353.

and the areas under the Palestinian National Authority. The author, who was the Jerusalem Scholar at the British School of Archaeology in Jerusalem in 1990-1991, provides us with an illustrated catalogue of 38 Palestinian hammams (curiously, the table of contents lists only 31 of them) and, for comparison, one hammam in Cairo. He also discusses the architecture, building techniques, water supply and drainage of the hammams, and their Roman antecedents. Other chapters provide a brief history of Palestine, estimates of urban populations in the Mamluk and Ottoman periods, and information on the numbers of hammams and how they were administered. The monograph ends with a bibliography and a short glossary; there is no index.

Steam baths have been a feature of life in Palestine since the Hellenistic period, and the Arab conquerors of the region encountered both large public baths (*thermae*) and the much smaller domestic baths (*balnea*). In both cases, some of the rooms were heated by extensive hypocausts and ducts in the walls, all of which were connected to the furnace and permitted the circulation of hot smoke and gasses from the fire. In both cases, too, the interiors were lit by windows, many of which were glazed, and the hot and cold rooms had pools for bathing.

The Islamic baths of Palestine are closely similar to hammams of the same date in the rest of Greater Syria. Although they vary in size and complexity, all share the same basic components and layout (effectively shown in the diagram on p. 13). Bathers entered the main undressing room, beyond which were the latrine and second undressing room, heated by an underfloor smoke duct, for use in winter. After the winter undressing room, bathers came to the warm room (not always present in smaller hammams) and the hot room, which was next to the furnace. Generally, the hot room was associated with several small rooms used for washing. Unlike the baths in Egypt, which had large pools, Palestinian hammams were furnished with small pools and basins.

Thus, the Islamic baths preserve many of the features of Roman *balnea*. Hypocausts, however, were replaced by simple channels beneath the floor of the heated room and single chimneys replaced the ducts in the walls. At the same time, the use of pools declined; in the hot room, most bathers washed by pouring water over their bodies instead of immersing themselves and in the cold room, pools ceased to be a regular feature. Furthermore, windows were replaced by perforations in the roof: terracotta tubes with glass covers, arranged in patterns, in the hot rooms and oculi in the cold rooms.

A limiting factor in the use of hammams — and many other activities — in Palestine was the absence of a year-round supply of surface water. Consequently, hammams were supplied with rain water collected in cisterns or reservoirs, or with ground water from nearby aquifers. Jerusalem, for example, had high- and low-level aqueducts that brought ground water from Artas, one of which supplied the hammams in the Sūq al-Qaṭṭānīn.

In Mamluk and Ottoman times, the majority of hammams were built as profit-making endowments of a *waqf*, or religious foundation. In such cases, the profit was used for the charitable purpose of the *waqf* itself. The administrators of the *waqf* usually leased the hammam to an individual who managed it on a day to day basis, although the *waqf* remained responsible for repairs. (During the crusader occupation,

some of the hammams in Jerusalem were owned by the church, while others belonged to Italian merchants.)

We know little about the running costs of hammams. Information is scarce, and inflation and fluctuations in exchange rates make interpretation of the scattered data difficult. It is clear, however, that hammams were expensive. Income had to cover the cost of wages, fuel and water, before the lessee began to make a profit. Because of the expense, Ibn Khaldun claimed that hammams could only survive in large cities. This, Dow points out, was an exaggeration. Ramleh had a population of only 2,000, but it supported a hammam throughout the Ottoman period.

As in many cultures, bathing was a social activity and a visit to the hammam might occupy several hours. Men might punctuate their washing by smoking a water-pipe and women, who had access to very few other places of entertainment, might relax together by singing and playing the hand-drum. The hammam was also a place to gather for ritual celebrations such as weddings. In Nablus, for example, the family of the bride invited the women of the groom's family to the hammam one day before the marriage. The assembled guests were given refreshments, after which members of the bride's family washed her, and the whole company shared a meal.

Approximately half of *The Islamic Baths of Palestine* is devoted to the catalogue of the hammams. Whenever possible, the author provides a description of the building, a plan or plans, and one or more photographs. The descriptions are short and to the point; indeed, even the longest is only a few hundred words and none of them can be called exhaustive. The plans, whether originals made by the author or tracings from earlier documents, are clear and in most cases they are conveniently reproduced at scales of 1:200 or (for details) 1:100. Generally, the photographs are useful documents of buildings, which in many cases face an uncertain future (the significance of Plate 29, however, eluded me).

The most extensive description documents the Hammam al-Basha in Acre. This Ottoman bath ceased to function in 1947 and it has since been restored as a museum of traditional culture. It is not only accessible but also well-preserved, with 18th-century glazed tiles on some of the walls and decorative, polished-stone floors. Approximately 20 percent of all the illustrations in the book are of the Ḥammām al-Bāshā. On the other hand, shortage of time and problems of access have resulted in some of the other descriptions being very short and insufficiently illustrated. Nablus, for example, contains eight hammams (the largest number surviving in any Palestinian city); but the longest description fills a page and the shortest is a single paragraph, while four of the eight lack plans and only two have photographs.

The Islamic Baths of Palestine is useful introduction to the Mamluk and Ottoman hammams of the region but it is not a definitive account. None of the hammams are recorded comprehensively and several of the descriptions are very short indeed. Nevertheless, the descriptions, plans and photographs are a welcome record of a neglected class of buildings, some of which are under threat of destruction by demolition or neglect.

Corning, April 1997

David WHITEHOUSE

* *
*

KORTE AANKONDIGINGEN

SPAGNOLO, John (ed.) — Problems of the Modern Middle East in Historical Perspective. Essays in Honour of Albert Hourani. Ithaca Press, London, 1996. (23 cm, VIII, 309). £12.95, ISBN 0 86372 214 8.

This is a paperback edition of the Festschrift offered to Albert Hourani in 1992 by his students, colleagues and friends. It was only shortly afterwards, in January 1993, that Hourani died.

Since this is a reprint rather than a new edition it seems more practical to give the table of contents rather than to present a new review. The editor has added an introduction: Hourani, An Appreciation.

The other contributions are:

- I The Establishment and Dismantling of the Province of Syria, 1865-1888, Butrus Abu-Manneh
- II From Consciousness to Activism: Feminist Politics in Early Twentieth Century Egypt, Margot Badran
- III Continuity in Modern Egyptian History: The Wafd and the Muslim Brothers, Marius Deeb
- IV Women and Conflict in Lebanon, Leila Fawaz
- V *Nizam Ma Fi*: Discourses on Order, Disorder and History in a Lebanese Context, Michael Gilsean
- VI Taha Husain: The Critical Spirit, Ibrahim Ibrahim
- VII Society and Ideology in Late Ottoman Syria: Class, Education, Profession and Confession, Rashid Khalidi
- VIII Abd el-Kader and Arab Nationalism, John King
- IX The Jewish-Zionist and Arab-Palestinian National Communities: The Transposing Effect of a Century of Confrontation, Mashe Ma'oz
- X Revolutionaries, Fundamentalists and Women: Alternative Groups in the Arab World, A. Lutfi al-Sayyid Marsot
- XI Water in the International Relations of the Middle East: Israel and the Jordan River System, Thomas Naff
- XII Architecture and Urban Development: Cairo during the Ottoman Period (1517-1798), André Raymond
- XIII The Famine of 1915-1918 in Greater Syria, L. Schatkowski-Schilcher
- XIV Sunnis and Shi'is Revisited: Sectarianism and Ethnicity in Authoritarian Iraq, Peter Sluglett & Marion Farouk-Sluglett
- XV The West and the Overburdened History of the Modern Middle East: Some General Considerations, John P. Spagnolo
- XVI A Bibliography Of Albert Hourani's published Works, Mary Wilson.

This paperback edition is very welcome, indeed.

* *
*

JERICHOW, A. & J. BEAK SIMONSEN (eds.) — Islam in a Changing World. Europe and the Middle East. Curzon Press, Ltd., London, 1997. (22 cm, XII, 190). ISBN 0-7007-0509-0. £14.99

Islam in a Changing World was the title of a conference attended by academics, politicians, journalists and officials, held in Copenhagen in June 1996. The debates were introduced by six international scholars: 1. R. Hrair Dekmejian, Multiple Faces of Islam. 2. Saad Eddin Ibrahim, The Troubled Triangle: Populism, Islam and Civil Society in the Arab

World. 3. Sharan Chubin, A Pan-Islamic Movement - Unity of Fragmentation? 4. Ahmad S. Moussalli, Discourses on Human Rights and Pluralistic Democracy. 5. Mir Zohair Husain, The Ideologization of Islam: Meaning, Manifestations and Causes. 6. Nemat Allah Adel Guenena, Islamic Activism in Egypt, 1974-1996. The seventh chapter was contributed by Anders Jerichow, foreign News Editor of the Danish daily Politiken, Civilizations: Clash or Cooperation? There are four annexes the first of which contains the speech by Juan Prat, General Director, European Commission, DGI, "The Euro-Mediterranean Partnership". The speech, by Ellen Margrethe Løj, State Secretary, Ambassador, Denmark, forms the subject matter of annex 2. Annex 3 consists of the newspaper article which the Danish Minister for Foreign Affairs, Niels Helveg Petersen, contributed to the daily Politiken, 17 June 1996: "The Muslim World and the West - a Need for Dialogue". Henriette Rald Gives samples of Danish newspaper illustrations in annex 4.

* *
*

HELLER, Erdmute und Hassouna MOSBAHI (Hrsg.) — Arabische Erzählungen der Gegenwart. (Neue Orientalische Bibliothek). C.H. Beck'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung, München, 1997. (20 cm, 368). ISBN 3-4060-42408-2. Ln DM 44,-.

The present book offers the reader a selection of 33 modern stories written by authors from Egypt, Sudan, Tunisia, Morocco, Libiya, Syria, Jordan, Palestine, Lebanon, Irak and Saudi Arabia. Their dates of birth vary from 1911 (Nagib Mahfuz, Egypt) to 1956 (Saad ad-Dusri, Saudi Arabia). The other authors are: Henriette Abbudi (1922 (?) Syria), Ibrahim Aslan (1939, Egypt), Kannatha Bannuna (1940, Morocco), Muhammad al-Bisati (1936, Egypt), Ahmad Buzfur (1945, Morocco), Ahmad Ibrahim al-Fakih (1939, Libiya), Gamal al-Ghitani (1945, Egypt), Yussuf Idris (1927, Egypt), Walid Ikhlas (1933, Syria), Mustapha al-Mesnawi (1953, Morocco), Muhammad al-Minzi Kandil (1948, Egypt), Hassouna Mosbahi (1950, Tunisia), Mu'nis ar-Razzaz (1950, Jordan), Yasin Rifa'iya (1929, Syria), Idris as Saghiri (1948, Morocco), at-Tayib Salih (1929, Sudan), Salema Salih (1942, Irak), Ghada Samman (1942, Syria), Mahdi Isa as-Saqr (1926, Irak), Hannan asch-Schaich (1942, Lebanon), Khairi Schalabi (1930, Egypt), Yusuf asch-Scharuni (1930, Egypt), Zakariya Tamir (1929, Lebanon), Hasb Allah Yahya (1943, Irak), Muhammad Zafzaf (1945, Morocco).

The editors have provided a very readable introduction to modern Arabic prose literature. The publisher deserves to be praised for the beautiful printing and binding.